

Fifth Session – Forty-Second Legislature
of the
Legislative Assembly of Manitoba
DEBATES
and
PROCEEDINGS
Official Report
(Hansard)

*Published under the
authority of
The Honourable Myrna Driedger
Speaker*

Vol. LXXVII No. 8 - 1:30 p.m., Thursday, November 24, 2022

ISSN 0542-5492

MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY
Forty-Second Legislature

Member	Constituency	Political Affiliation
ALTomARE, Nello	Transcona	NDP
ASAGWARA, Uzoma	Union Station	NDP
BRAR, Diljeet	Burrows	NDP
BUSHIE, Ian	Keewatinook	NDP
CLARKE, Eileen, Hon.	Agassiz	PC
COX, Cathy	Kildonan-River East	PC
CULLEN, Cliff, Hon.	Spruce Woods	PC
DRIEDGER, Myrna, Hon.	Roblin	PC
EICHLER, Ralph	Lakeside	PC
EWASKO, Wayne, Hon.	Lac du Bonnet	PC
FONTAINE, Nahanni	St. Johns	NDP
FRIESEN, Cameron, Hon.	Morden-Winkler	PC
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Lib.
GOERTZEN, Kelvin, Hon.	Steinbach	PC
GORDON, Audrey, Hon.	Southdale	PC
GUENTER, Josh	Borderland	PC
GUILLEMARD, Sarah, Hon.	Fort Richmond	PC
HELWER, Reg, Hon.	Brandon West	PC
ISLEIFSON, Len	Brandon East	PC
JOHNSON, Derek, Hon.	Interlake-Gimli	PC
JOHNSTON, Scott, Hon.	Assiniboia	PC
KHAN, Obby	Fort Whyte	PC
KINEW, Wab	Fort Rouge	NDP
LAGASSÉ, Bob	Dawson Trail	PC
LAGIMODIERE, Alan, Hon.	Selkirk	PC
LAMONT, Dougald	St. Boniface	Lib.
LAMOUREUX, Cindy	Tyndall Park	Lib.
LATHLIN, Amanda	The Pas-Kameesak	NDP
LINDSEY, Tom	Flin Flon	NDP
MALOWAY, Jim	Elmwood	NDP
MARCELINO, Malaya	Notre Dame	NDP
MARTIN, Shannon	McPhillips	PC
MICHALESKI, Brad	Dauphin	PC
MICKLEFIELD, Andrew	Rossmere	PC
MORLEY-LECOMTE, Janice	Seine River	PC
MOSES, Jamie	St. Vital	NDP
NAYLOR, Lisa	Wolseley	NDP
NESBITT, Greg, Hon.	Riding Mountain	PC
PEDERSEN, Blaine	Midland	PC
PIWNIUK, Doyle, Hon.	Turtle Mountain	PC
REDHEAD, Eric	Thompson	NDP
REYES, Jon, Hon.	Waverley	PC
SALA, Adrien	St. James	NDP
SANDHU, Mintu	The Maples	NDP
SCHULER, Ron	Springfield-Ritchot	PC
SMITH, Andrew, Hon.	Lagimodière	PC
SMITH, Bernadette	Point Douglas	NDP
SMOOK, Dennis	La Vérendrye	PC
SQUIRES, Rochelle, Hon.	Riel	PC
STEFANSON, Heather, Hon.	Tuxedo	PC
TEITSMA, James	Radisson	PC
WASYLIW, Mark	Fort Garry	NDP
WHARTON, Jeff, Hon.	Red River North	PC
WIEBE, Matt	Concordia	NDP
WISHART, Ian	Portage la Prairie	PC
WOWCHUK, Rick	Swan River	PC
<i>Vacant</i>	Kirkfield Park	

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Thursday, November 24, 2022

The House met at 1:30 p.m.

Clerk (Ms. Patricia Chaychuk): It is my duty to inform the House that the Speaker is unavoidably absent. Therefore, in accordance with the statutes, I would ask the Deputy Speaker to please take the Chair.

Mr. Deputy Speaker (Andrew Micklefield): O Eternal and Almighty God, from Whom all power and wisdom come, we are assembled here before Thee to frame such laws as may tend to the welfare and prosperity of our province. Grant, O merciful God, we pray Thee, that we may desire only that which is in accordance with Thy will, that we may seek it with wisdom and know it with certainty and accomplish it perfectly for the glory and honour of Thy name and for the welfare of all our people. Amen.

We acknowledge we are gathered on Treaty 1 territory and that Manitoba is located on the treaty territories and ancestral lands of the Anishinaabeg, Anishinewuk, Dakota Oyate, Denesuline and Nehethowuk nations. We acknowledge Manitoba is located on the Homeland of the Red River Métis. We acknowledge northern Manitoba includes lands that were and are the ancestral lands of the Inuit. We respect the spirit and intent of treaties and treaty making and remain committed to working in partnership with First Nations, Inuit and Métis people in the spirit of truth, reconciliation and collaboration.

Good afternoon, everybody. Please be seated.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

INTRODUCTION OF BILLS

Bill 8—The Off-Road Trails Safety and Maintenance Act

Hon. Jeff Wharton (Minister of Environment, Climate and Parks): Mr. Deputy Speaker, I move, seconded by the Minister of Natural Resources and Northern Development (Mr. Nesbitt), that Bill 8, The Off-Road Trails Safety and Maintenance Act, be now read for a first time.

Motion presented.

Mr. Wharton: Mr. Deputy Speaker, it gives me great pleasure to introduce The Off-Road Trails Safety and Maintenance Act. The purpose of this bill is to advance a new user fee on registered off-road vehicles

that will support the enhanced development and maintenance of safe snowmobile and all-terrain vehicle trails, increase safety training, driver education and other such programs to ensure the long-term sustainability of our key off-road vehicle partner organizations.

A portion of the funds will be allocated to support rehabilitation of any lands and trails that have been damaged by off-road vehicle activity. This will help provide Manitobans with safe recreational opportunities while also attracting off-road vehicle enthusiasts from outside the province and generating economic development opportunities for small towns and businesses.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion? *[Agreed]*

Committee Reports? Tabling of Reports?

MINISTERIAL STATEMENTS

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Minister of Sport, Culture and Heritage—and I would advise the House the required 90 minutes notice prior to 'racine'—routine proceedings was provided in accordance with the rules.

Holodomor Memorial Day

Hon. Andrew Smith (Minister of Sport, Culture and Heritage): Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable minister. Yes, please go ahead.

Mr. Smith: I rise today in solemn observance of the 90th anniversary of Holodomor Memorial Day, which we commemorate the fourth Saturday of November.

While the world has certainly seen its share of genocides and human rights violations, Holodomor, given the fact that it's the combination of genocide and famine, made it that much more appalling.

Since the illegal occupation of Ukraine by Russia, we've seen the resurrection of legitimate fears and painful memories of Ukrainians living in both in Ukraine, here in Manitoba and of course, around the world.

One out of seven Manitobans are of Ukrainian descent, myself included, Mr. Deputy Speaker. In fact, my

baba—grandmother—was a Holodomor survivor. As a child, I was certainly spared some of the details of that experience, but at the time, she was not much older than who my son is today.

As an adult I became more aware, not through my grandmother but through my mother, of the details of her experience in Holodomor. And it's an experience, I know, that's been shared by folks in Ukraine, by the diaspora of Ukrainians around the world and here in Manitoba.

That's why today, to commemorate the lives lost and those who survived against all odds; the Holodomor statue outside the lawn of the Manitoba Legislature; the little girl grasping a shaft of wheat, showing both her vulnerability but also her iron-clad determination to survive against the odds.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I believe that is the story of Ukrainians, not only Ukraine but their diaspora around the world: the survival against the odds. We've seen an illegal, horrific occupation by Russia of the sovereign, independent country of Ukraine. We know that Ukraine has an incredible fight on their hands, but we've seen them prevail and we know that, one day, that's what they will do.

I say, Mr. Deputy Speaker, *slava Ukraini [glory to Ukraine]*, *heroyam slava [glory to the heroes]* and *dyakuyu [thank you]*.

Before we go on to the rest of the responses to the minister's statement, I do ask for a moment of silence to commemorate those who perished during the Holodomor starvation and those who did manage to survive.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: It is the tradition of the House to have a moment of silence after the responses have been given. Is there leave to do that after the other responses? *[Agreed]*

Okay, so we'll do that after the responses.

Mr. Mark Wasyliv (Fort Garry): On November 23rd, the world commemorates the famine of the 1932-1933 in Ukraine known as the Holodomor, which roughly translates to English as the death by hunger.

In 1986, British historian Robert Conquest published a heart-wrenching recollection of the famine entitled *harvest of sorrow*. As one of the first and most detailed accounts of the famine, the information from the book spread global awareness of the starvation and repression of the Ukrainian peoples.

Some estimates put the death toll at 14 million during the year-long famine. This horrible event has inflicted deep and lasting scars on the Ukrainian community here and throughout the world.

There are strong and vibrant Ukrainian communities here in Manitoba and across the country, many of whom immigrated due to the famine. Generations of Ukrainian Canadians have continued to deal with the intergenerational effects of the famine, and continue to deal with the persecution of their nation.

This genocidal famine is recognized by the provincial government as an atrocity and a dark page in human history. As Manitobans have historically had a significant population of Ukrainian families, as well as the recent influx of Ukrainian refugees due to the ongoing genocidal war, it is more important now than ever to recognize and commemorate the ongoing and historic oppression of the Ukrainian peoples.

* (13:40)

The same sentiment which fuelled the Holodomor still exist today, and as the war of Russian aggression on Ukraine today continues its aims for the extinguishment of Ukrainian culture and nation.

The fourth Saturday in November is recognized as Ukrainian famine and genocide Holodomor memorial day, and as such I urge the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to join with the Ukrainian community in commemorating this tragic event. And by honouring the survivors and those who lost their lives in the famine, we are bringing awareness to the tragedies of the past as well as their continuing war in Ukraine, which has already caused so much death, destruction and displacement.

In learning these hard lessons from the past, we only hope that we can better understand the fight for genocidal wars in the present.

Vichnaya pamyat, vichnaya pamyat, vichnaya pamyat, eternal memory, eternal memory, eternal memory.

Ms. Cindy Lamoureux (Tyndall Park): I ask for leave to respond to the minister's statement.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Member have leave? *[Agreed]*

The honourable member for Tyndall Park has leave. Please go ahead.

Ms. Lamoureux: I rise today in solemn remembrance of the Ukrainian famine and genocide known as the Holodomor.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, the famine imposed on Ukraine began with waves of deportation of Ukraine's farmers, as well as deportations and executions of Ukraine's religious, intellectual and cultural leaders.

This intentional starvation resulted in the death of millions of people, and at the height of the Holodomor, 28,000 people died per day. Over 30 per cent were children under 10 years old.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, several years back I visited Kyiv, Ukraine, and had the chance to experience the national museum memorial to Holodomor victims. To this day, this experience resonates with me. The museum portrayed the suffering that millions of people went through and illustrated how horrific this famine was.

Every time I reflect upon this experience, I think about the two angels of sorrow that stood at the front of the museum and represent the guardians of the souls who starved.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we have one of the most recognized statues of the Holodomor here on our Legislative grounds. The statue, titled the Bitter Memories of Childhood, stands to the west of us and is a young girl clutching a handful of wheat. This statue has been dedicated to the most vulnerable victims of starvation.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, the Holodomor was aimed as an act of genocide, and today we see how resilient Ukrainian people all over the world are.

I am proud of the strong and growing presence of Ukrainians where we are fortunate to have such an active community here in Manitoba providing us with opportunities to learn.

Today, we rise to remember the victims and their families of this senseless crime against humanity. This history is terrible and unexplainable, but we must continue to share it in remembrance and the hope to learn from the past.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: As previously agreed, we'll now have a moment of silence. Please rise.

A moment of silence was observed.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Minister of Economic Development, Investment and Trade. *[interjection]* Yes, thank you. And I do indicate to the House that the required 90 minutes notice was provided.

The honourable minister, please go ahead.

Small Business Saturday

Hon. Cliff Cullen (Minister of Economic Development, Investment and Trade): I'm pleased to rise in the House today and inform all members and Manitobans watching that this Saturday, November 26th, is Small Business Saturday.

Small businesses are the backbone of our economy and the heart and soul of our business community here in Manitoba.

We all know the last two years have been extremely hard on small businesses across our country and our province. Our government has continually stood with Manitoba small businesses, making record investments to ensure they receive the help they deserve.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I'd like to thank Canadian Federation of Independent Business, who started Small Business Saturday over a decade ago, for their continuous advocacy and support of their over 4,000 members here in Manitoba.

The need to rally Manitobans around local businesses is particularly important this holiday season. I encourage members of the House and all Manitobans to participate in supporting small businesses on November 26th. I also encourage everyone to support small business throughout this entire holiday season.

Please post on social media to spread the word while tagging CFIB and using the hashtag #SmallBusinessSaturday.

Thank you very much, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Jamie Moses (St. Vital): During the weekend between Black Friday and Cyber Monday is Small Business Saturday, a day to recognize the important role that small businesses play in our communities and commit to supporting them.

There are so many benefits to shopping from local businesses, and it is an excellent way to keep—to help our communities grow and remain thriving. It also supports the more than 10 million Canadian workers who work at small and medium-sized businesses. Shopping local keeps your hard-earned dollars in the province, because nearly 70 per cent of small retailers buy from other small businesses. Two thirds of small retailers donate time and money to local charities, so supporting them is supporting local causes as well.

In spite of all these positive benefits of shopping local, we know that small businesses in Manitoba are struggling. A recent CBC article talked to several

small businesses in Winnipeg about the difficulty they face in being able to afford to stay open. They described having to make devastating decisions to lay off staff or cut back hours, because they simply cannot afford to keep them on, and monitoring the cash flow every day to make sure they can afford to open the next day.

And not all businesses make it: it seems almost every week, we hear about another beloved small business in Winnipeg that isn't able to continue its business due to the rising costs and falling sales.

Although it's true that the Manitoba NDP has always supported small—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The member's time has expired.

An Honourable Member: Leave?

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is there leave for the member to continue?

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I hear a no.

Mr. Dougald Lamont (St. Boniface): Mr. Deputy Speaker, I seek leave to speak to the ministerial statement.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is there leave for the member for St. Boniface to speak to the minister's statement?
[Agreed]

Mr. Lamont: I'm proud to say that, prior to entering politics, I worked to help launch many small businesses, and locally owned businesses have a vital and outsized impact on the—[interjection]

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order, please.

Mr. Lamont: —communities they serve.

AMIBA, which is a US small business association, calculated that for every \$100 spent at a locally owned and operated store or business, \$45 stays in the community. By contrast, for every \$100 spent at a chain store or franchise, only \$13 stays in the community; while, when purchased at Amazon or another web giant, of that \$100, only \$1 will stay in the community. This economic fact shows it's—why it is so important to support Manitoba owned and operated businesses, producers, manufacturers and service providers.

We continue to call on the Manitoba government to step up with supports. I am proud of the work we've done in supporting Manitoba small businesses. We helped broker a deal between the federal government, First Nations fishers and the Freshwater Fish Marketing

Corporation, which resulted in \$10.8 million in freshwater fish being distributed for free to 75 First Nations, clearing a backlog that allowed for the industry to get back to work, restoring 3,000 jobs across Manitoba and Western Canada.

The pandemic and shattering of global supply chains has shown just how fragile and overdependent our economy can be. Today's crises and tough times will pass. We need to make the investments now to make sure that small businesses will stay open. We hope Manitobans will continue to support small businesses and we hope the Manitoba government will as well.

Thank you.

Introduction of Guests

Mr. Deputy Speaker: We have seated in the public gallery, from Immanuel Christian School, 18 grade 4 students. This group is located in the constituency of the honourable member for Radisson (Mr. Teitsma).

We welcome you to the Manitoba Legislature today and hope you have a great time.

MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

BAPS Shri Swaminarayan Mandir

Mr. Ron Schuler (Springfield-Ritchot): It is always exciting to see our communities grow in the constituency of Springfield-Ritchot.

* (13:50)

One such example of growth can be found just off of PTH 75. It is here that a community of Hindu worshippers at the BAPS Shri Swaminarayan Mandir have put down roots. This group of worshippers has been meeting since the early 1990s, but as their numbers and membership grew, the need for a place of their own to meet became paramount.

They purchased this space in 2020, and volunteers worked tirelessly to renovate the property to prepare it for worshippers. They had their grand opening on September 19th, 2021.

This space, while small, is quickly expanding to accommodate the growing group of attendees. This mandir allows for them to provide activities to the community that preserve Hindu traditions, heritage and spiritual values.

I had the distinct pleasure of joining them at their new mandir for their Diwali celebration this month. It was exciting to be able to come and experience this event alongside our Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) and the

Minister of Advanced Education, Skills and Immigration (Mr. Reyes). During the tour of their facility, they showed us the completed sections of the mandir and also toured the larger space that they are in the process of renovating to provide even more area for worshippers to gather.

We are so excited to have the BAPS Shri Swaminarayan Mandir in our community and want to extend a warm welcome. It's always exciting to see our communities grow like this. Spiritual groups such as this mandir make a community feel like home, as its place—as it's in places like this that the community loves to gather in.

I cannot wait to be able to attend at the BAPS Shri Swaminarayan Mandir again in the future.

Disability Benefits

Ms. Lisa Naylor (Wolseley): Supporting Manitobans with disabilities must be a priority for this government, but the way to do it is not by providing support to some and leaving out others.

With the government's proposed program changes, thousands of vulnerable Manitobans will soon lose benefits. The government's own regulatory consultation website acknowledges that approximately 2,000 households are going to lose disability benefits.

The newly designed program leaves out those experiencing disabilities that may last for more than—for less than one year. I'm thinking of people who are experiencing problems that are affecting them for an undetermined period such as those experiencing long COVID.

Constituents in Wolseley have voiced concerns about folks with severe and prolonged disabling mental health, who are unable to work but do not fall under the definition required for the severe and prolonged disability benefit.

The government's process for creating the assessment tool for this program was also concerning. MNP, a private for-profit consultancy firm, was paid over \$250,000. This was a very unusual expense, given the department's own experts who are very capable. There are legitimate questions that need answers about whether this tool is designed with a focus on the public good and the actual needs of recipients. Too often, this government turns to private contractors because they are focused solely on dollars and cents and not the concerns of Manitobans.

The people that these benefits are supposed to help—those with long-term disabilities—have been left

for years wondering when they will receive benefits. When the government passed the bill in 2021, consultations had not even begun.

It is time for the government to step up and provide fair and appropriate benefits for all Manitobans experiencing disabilities.

Seeking Mental Wellness

Mr. Bob Lagassé (Dawson Trail): The last couple of months, I have felt like I was dead inside. I would go through the motions of my day and put a smile on. I would often get into my truck at the beginning and the end of the day and break down crying. The dark thoughts of self-harm had started coming often and there was no reason that I could think of. I could not shake myself out of being hyper-focused on these thoughts. This sense of hopelessness followed me around, very much like Eeyore and his cloud.

Looking back now, I realize it was not one thing but several things that had been piling up, my untreated ADHD/depression being a major contributing factor.

I have learnt in the past few weeks, as a man, it's okay not to be okay and to recognize this doesn't make you weak.

As a man, we have been told since we are young: you need to walk it off, stop being a sissy and men don't cry. All of these statements are lies, and I'm here to tell you, seeking help doesn't make you weak. You do not have to walk it off and it's okay to cry.

I will continue to fight to spread awareness and take this head-on with the help of my doctor, friends and family. The member of Fort Richmond had recently read a statement on behalf of Stacia. Reflecting back, this was one of the reasons I decided to start seeking help for my own mental health journey.

If you find yourself today feeling less than you are, I'm here to tell you you are important and you are loved. I want to encourage you to talk to your doctor, a friend, a family member or someone you trust. You are here for a purpose. The tattooed semi-colon on my thumb reminds me my story is not over yet and neither is yours.

To the members of this Chamber, I have only one message: Be kind to one another, be uplifting, be truthful. In this environment of political theatre, we tend to be harmful to the detriment of our own and others' mental health. And remember, it's okay not to be okay. What's not okay is to go through it alone.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Dr. Krishan Sethi

MLA Tom Lindsey (Flin Flon): Today I rise to recognize Dr. Krishan Sethi, one of Flin Flon's longest serving practitioners.

Dr. Sethi first came to Flin Flon in 1980 to work for a few years, but ended up staying for 43. Unfortunately, Dr. Sethi has made the tough decision to close his medical practice on November 30th of this year.

During his time in Flin Flon, Dr. Sethi not only worked as a general practitioner, but was also trained in obstetrics, pediatrics and anesthetics. He worked tirelessly on rotation in Flin Flon and Winnipeg operating rooms and emergency departments for many years. His active service to the community allowed our operating and delivery rooms to thrive for many years. With his incredible education and abilities, Dr. Sethi has truly been a great asset in our community.

Most recently Dr. Sethi focused on his general practice, looking after patients at his clinic. He worked hard to recruit a physician to take over his practice, going as far as offering his files to a local doctor for free. Unfortunately, he was not successful in finding someone to take over his patients.

In 2005, he was named Doctor of the Year by his peers, the College of Physicians and Surgeons. He was awarded Manitoba's Top Family Doctor by the Manitoba College of Family Physicians. Dr. Sethi was the first northern physician to receive these honors and titles. In 2006, he was awarded for his rural service by the Society of Rural Physicians and in 2013, he was awarded a fellowship by the College of Family Physicians of Canada.

Dr. Sethi's retirement is well deserved. He will be missed by all community members that he faithfully served.

Dr. Sethi and his wife, Poomidevi, have two daughters, Roshini and Avani, as well as four lovely grandchildren. And we all wish him well.

Thank you.

St. Raphael Wellness Centre

Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights): Mr. Deputy Speaker, I speak today of the St. Raphael Wellness Centre and the extraordinary work that they do. The centre is a welcoming community-based, recovery-oriented organization for people in pre and continuing recovery. They specialize in working with individuals

before they get into addiction recovery treatment and after they complete the basic 45-day programs. This fills an important gap in the care provided elsewhere in the province.

They offer non-residential education and counselling morning, afternoon and evening for individuals and their families, and their dedicated staff and volunteers build strong connections with those in their care.

The St. Raphael Wellness Centre believes that there are many paths to recovery. They use the evidence-based continuum of recovery model and follow 10 guiding principles. Though they are not 12-step based, they are very supportive of those who attend self-help groups as part of their continuing recovery.

For nearly 50 years they have positively impacted the lives of so many individuals and families suffering from mental health and substance abuse problems. In short, they are one of the best kept secrets in Winnipeg.

Despite being highly regarded in the community by their referral network and being lauded by their participants, successive governments haven't been adequately aware of or supportive of their work, nor clearly understood the value of the work they do within the community.

* (14:00)

In the gallery today from the St. Raphael Wellness Centre, I welcome Colleen Allan, executive director; Gordon Pratt, work sober counsellor and evening program co-ordinator; and Elysia DuVal, outreach intake person.

We encourage all MLAs to attend their AGM on Wednesday, November 30th. Please come and learn for yourself more about the St. Raphael Wellness Centre and why it should not be kept secret any longer.

Thank you. Merci. Miigwech.

ORAL QUESTIONS

Health-Care System Wait-Time Concerns

Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition): Just want to say a couple words to our friend from Dawson Trail. Want to thank you for putting yourself on the line like that, certainly not easy.

And we want you to be well. We value you. We know that you're hurting, but we got your back. And reach out any time. And if reaching out to the

Leader of the Opposition isn't the easiest thing for a PC member to do, I'm sure everyone else in the Chamber feels the same way and would take your call at the appropriate moment.

Emergency rooms in Manitoba are in crisis. Wait times are longer than they have ever been: HSC, St. Boniface, the Grace, Brandon.

Why have the PCs failed to address the crisis in ERs, just like Brian Pallister?

Hon. Heather Stefanson (Premier): I, too, want to extend my very best to the member for Dawson Trail (Mr. Lagassé). It's not easy to stand before us and to make that kind of a statement.

And you know what? We are so incredibly proud of you. This is not a partisan time; this is here for you, my friend, and we are all here for you. And I'm so incredibly proud of you, just like the note that I sent you earlier and many of the notes that you're getting from members in the Chamber.

Thank you for everything that you do, and we're here for you, my friend.

And as for the litany of the false accusations in the Leader of the Opposition's question, I'll address those in the next question.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a follow-up question.

Mr. Kinew: Yes, I just want to table the proof that shows that wait times are longer than they have ever been in Manitoba.

When we're talking about emergency care, when we're talking about people waiting to access that, we're talking about seniors who are sitting in hard plastic chairs. We're talking about people with young children who are waiting hours on end. We're talking about our loved ones and our neighbours across Manitoba.

This is the record of Brian Pallister and it's the record of this PC government. Their cuts, signed off by this Cabinet, supported by every member of that caucus, are the reason that wait times are so bad.

Will the Premier admit that PC cuts have harmed health care at emergency rooms and across our province?

Mrs. Stefanson: I certainly remember a time back in the previous NDP government where people were waiting upwards of 30 hours in emergency rooms in the province of Manitoba. And that wasn't just after a worldwide pandemic where there's been significant

challenges, not just here in Manitoba, but right across our country. And that's why we set up the surgical and diagnostic task force to help address these issues.

But I tell you one thing, Mr. Deputy Speaker, we will not take an ideological approach when it comes to making sure that Manitobans get the health care that they need, when they need it. We will always put patients first.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

Mr. Kinew: I encourage the Premier to look at the documents that I tabled. They show that wait times are worse than they've ever been.

What those wait times, tracked month over month, also show is that these skyrocketing waits in ERs started before the pandemic. It began when this government started to close emergency rooms, when they laid off—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Kinew: —all the nurses in those emergency room facilities and forced them, in a very undignified way, to battle each other to try and get their jobs back.

And, of course, in that mix-up—in that period in which their own health consultant said that they were mismanaging health care, many nurses and other allied health-care professionals were left behind.

Will the Premier just admit that their cuts have caused harm to health care in Manitoba?

Mrs. Stefanson: Well, Mr. Deputy Speaker, what will not help us tackle the surgical and diagnostic backlogs in the province of Manitoba is taking an ideological approach to health care in the province of Manitoba.

Some 12,000 Manitobans received successful surgeries at private providers in Manitoba over the last two years, and in the coming months, 13,000 Manitobans are scheduled to get their surgeries and diagnostic procedures in these private delivery facilities.

And I will just remind Manitobans that, if the NDP was in charge, none of those Manitobans would get the care that they need.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a new question.

Physician Retention

Mr. Kinew: No, no one believes that. Everyone knows they cut health care. Everyone knows we're going to fix it.

When we get to documenting the damage of the cuts that they've made to the health-care system, though, we see another concerning data point over and above the skyrocketing ER wait times which are being published today. We also see that the physician shortage in Manitoba is at an all-time high. That means that it's worse than it's ever been—another result of the PC's cuts to health care.

Of particular concern, though, when we look at these numbers, is that this loss of physicians working at the bedside has only accelerated since this Premier took office.

I'd ask the Premier: Why has the number of physicians leaving the profession increased by 13 per cent since she was sworn in?

Mrs. Stefanson: I was very pleased to be with my colleague, the Minister of Health (Ms. Gordon), alongside Doctors Manitoba two weeks ago, and a \$200-million announcement on health human resources action plan, investing two—into 2,000 health-care professionals in the province of Manitoba, and that includes doctors, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

So, we are listening to Manitobans, we are taking action and we're getting things done for Manitobans.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a follow-up question.

Mr. Kinew: Well, since the Premier's taken office, the health-care crisis in our province has only gotten worse, and it's worse than it's ever been. We heard from emergency room doctors at St. Boniface that the crisis is worse than they have ever seen before.

And now we see, when it's about physicians leaving their practices in Manitoba, not only is that it—at an all-time high, but more physicians have left office since this Premier was sworn in—13 per cent, that's how much the physician shortage has grown since the Stefanson government took over from Brian Pallister.

Just like Brian Pallister, though, the cuts continue.

Will the Premier finally admit that the PC cuts are harming health care in Manitoba?

Mrs. Stefanson: I'll just remind the member opposite that, when they were in power in 2001, we went from

fourth most doctors per capita to eighth in between 2009 and 2016. They failed to address staffing shortages then and they failed to retain hundreds of nurses.

But let me just read a quote from the previous minister of—NDP minister of Health: But we recognize that physician recruitment and retention to rural hospitals isn't just an issue—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mrs. Stefanson: —here in Manitoba, it's an issue across the country.

Even back then, the then-NDP minister of Health got it, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

We are taking action: 2,000 more health-care professionals in the province of Manitoba. We're listening to Manitobans. We're working with stakeholders, including Doctors Manitoba, to address these very important issues.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

Mr. Kinew: No. Because for all the Premier said, the physician shortage is worse than it's ever been. It's at an all-time high. Whether we look at the closures in communities like—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Kinew: —Grandview, whether we look at the emergency room wait times or whether we're talking about the amount of physicians caring for Manitobans, we see that in—*[interjection]*

* (14:10)

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Kinew: —category after category, things in health care are worse than they've ever been.

So the question is simple: Will the Premier explain why Manitoba's doctor shortage got worse by 13 per cent since she took office?

Mrs. Stefanson: Maybe the Leader of the Opposition can explain to Manitobans why it got worse under the NDP watch, when we went fourth most doctors per capita in the country in 2001 to eighth from—between 2009 and 2016. So maybe he can explain that.

Manitobans know, Mr. Deputy Speaker, that the NDP government at the time closed almost 20 rural emergency rooms. Manitobans don't want to go back to the dark days of the previous NDP government.

The Leader of the Opposition has no plan, no vision for the future of health care in our province. I will tell you right now, we on this side of the House will always put patients first to ensure that they get the health care that they need, when they need it, in Manitoba.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for Union Station. *[interjection]* Order.

COVID Pandemic Review Details and Timeline

MLA Uzoma Asagwara (Union Station): Deputy Speaker, we have seen many clear examples of why we need an independent inquiry into Manitoba's experience of the pandemic. We needed to know what led to the many, many failures that Manitobans are still dealing with.

Earlier this month, the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) indicated that they would, in fact, do a review.

I ask the minister: Who are they appointing to do this review, what is their budget and when can Manitobans expect to see the results?

Hon. Audrey Gordon (Minister of Health): Rarely does this happen by the member opposite or anyone in the NDP caucus, but I would like to rise today in this Chamber to thank our provincial chief public health officer, Dr. Roussin, his public health staff and their team for the incredible work that they have done over the past two and a half years to keep Manitobans safe, to send the message that we need to get vaccinated, that we need to look after our loved ones and ourselves, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Our government is coming alongside health professionals to ensure that they have the—all the services that they need to be able to respond to the needs of Manitobans.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable minister's time has expired.

MLA Asagwara: Deputy Speaker, I'll quote the Premier: What we need is to obviously review it and see what we can do better. End quote.

She goes on, and I'll quote again: We will do that type of review to see where we can learn from those lessons. End quote.

Manitobans actually expect that this work would've already been done, Deputy Speaker.

I ask the minister: Who are they appointing to lead this review, what is their budget and when will the findings of the review be made public to Manitobans?

Ms. Gordon: I can see that the narrative from the last session continues, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

First, the members opposite started with the Red Cross nurses, then they started to talk about paramedics and the new law of having paramedics assist in the emergency department.

Rarely do they stand in this Chamber and recognize or thank our public health officials who've kept them, their family members safe during a very, very—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon:—difficult pandemic.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we are going to continue to support public health and our public health officials and all Manitobans.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for Union Station, on a final supplementary.

MLA Asagwara: Deputy Speaker, I'll quote the Premier again: If there are lessons to be learned, we will do that type of review to see where we can learn. End quote.

Deputy Speaker, there is a lot that we can learn, especially about this government's cuts to the health-care system, their failures that resulted in 57 ICU patients being transported out of our province.

We need an expert-led, independent inquiry which will deliver the results to the public.

Will the minister and her government call an independent inquiry today?

Ms. Gordon: Will the members opposite, including the member for Union Station, rise in this Chamber today and thank our provincial chief public health officer, Dr. Roussin—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon:—all the public health officials, all the individuals who helped with our—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon:—vaccination clinics, Mr. Deputy Speaker; all the Manitobans who got first, second, third, fourth doses for helping to keep—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon: –Manitobans safe during a difficult pandemic?

Request to Establish Seniors Advocate Government Intention

MLA Malaya Marcelino (Notre Dame): The Throne Speech stated that seniors carried a tremendous burden through the pandemic. Yet, the Throne Speech offered little in support for Manitoba's seniors.

There was no commitment to build additional personal-care-home beds and no mention of home care. That's why Manitoba needs a seniors advocate to hold this government to account and to ensure that the PCs make seniors a priority.

The PCs should commit to creating a seniors advocate: Will they do so today?

Hon. Scott Johnston (Minister of Seniors and Long-Term Care): I would agree with the member that seniors do need advocacy.

They have a department within the Province of Manitoba who is advocating, they have a minister who is responsible for that department who is advocating, they have a Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) who is advocating and they have a—members on this side of the House who are advocating. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. *[interjection]* Order. *[interjection]* Order.

MLA Marcelino: In 2016, the PCs promised that they would build 1,200 new PCH beds, yet the opposite has happened: they've cut 216 beds and have cut funding to PCHs twice.

Millions of dollars in PC cuts have put tremendous strain on these trying to provide the best care they can for their beloved elders. The minister knows that this is wrong, and a seniors advocate would hold the PCs accountable for their cuts and broken promises.

Why is the minister refusing to establish a seniors advocate?

Mr. Johnston: I certainly appreciate that question, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

As I've indicated on many occasions in this House, we are doing a seniors strategy. And I can tell you, based on the meetings that I have had and based on the discussions with stakeholders and based on the priorities of Manitoba, we will be satisfying the initiative that the member brings forward to the House. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. *[interjection]* Order. *[interjection]* Order.

The honourable member for Notre Dame, on a final supplementary.

MLA Marcelino: You know, this minister has started his seniors strategy around April, but if the first order had been not to cut the Manitoba Council on Aging, which was a table advisory committee that provided all the expert information and research, then you would have had seven years to have already finished the strategy.

So it's clear that the PCs aren't prioritizing Manitoba's seniors. They've run the quality of home care into the ground, leaving seniors without the care that they need. They've cut 216 PCH beds despite promising to build 1,200 new ones.

A seniors advocate would give seniors a strong voice at the table, and it would also hold the PCs accountable for their cuts and broken promises—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The member's time has expired.

Mr. Johnston: As I indicated to the Leader of the Opposition earlier when he was asking questions in this House, I looked forward to the opposition coming and supporting the seniors strategy, because it will fulfill the needs of Manitobans.

And in regards to advice, let me reread the minister's advisory committee and the professionalism that's on that committee: Connie Newman, who was the chair; Mari-Jean Nachtigall; Dr. Russ Albak; Randi Gage; Kevin Scott; Rob Lavin; Charles Gagné, Dr. Judith Bartlett—*[interjection]*

* (14:20)

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Johnston: –Maureen Stefanson *[phonetic]*, Sherry Janzen. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Johnston: All people who are capable—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Johnston: –and all people who are advising this ministry. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I'm going to ask members to refrain from shouting across the aisle at each other. Let's have question period in its proper and intended format.

**PC Candidate for Kirkfield Park
Concerns Regarding Peter Nygård Connection**

Ms. Nahanni Fontaine (St. Johns): Kevin Klein is the PC candidate for Kirkfield Park.

Kevin claims he only worked for Peter Nygård for two weeks in 2012 and four weeks—or, four months, pardon me—in 2014. However—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —new video evidence shows Kevin Klein traveling to Belize with Peter Nygård in December of 2010.

Voters expect candidates to be honest with them about their work history. Kevin Klein is doing nothing of the sort.

Does the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) think it's acceptable for Klein to lie to Manitobans—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —about his work and his relationship with Peter Nygård?

Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General): Prior to our government changing the rules and requiring that those who are applying to be MLAs disclose their criminal activity, members opposite hid that.

In the last election, there was a candidate for Radisson—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Goertzen: —an NDP candidate for Radisson who had to disclose a Criminal Code conviction, a controlled drug and substance conviction and an income tax conviction, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

I'll table that for the House.

I wonder if the member can explain why only NDP candidates had to disclose criminal activity? *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. Order.

Ms. Fontaine: Video evidence, which I table today, shows Kevin Klein travelling to Belize with Peter Nygård in 2010 as part of his work with Nygard Biotech. That's two years earlier than Kevin Klein is telling the good voters of Kirkfield Park.

Candidates should be honest about their work history.

Ask any Manitoban—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —when applying for a new job, they agree that they—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —the person should be honest about their work history. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: Does the Premier think it's okay that Kevin Klein is lying—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —about his work history?

Mr. Goertzen: In addition to the criminal activity for the candidate I just tabled, the NDP Assiniboia candidate, in the last election, disclosed a criminal conviction for assault and failure to comply and the NDP candidate for Riding Mountain disclosed a shoplifting and an impaired driving conviction.

I'm not sure what the vetting process is for the NDP when it comes to candidates, but maybe the member opposite can tell me: is it a detriment to having a criminal charge become an NDP candidate or is it actually a benefit?

And I'll charge—and I'll table these. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. *[interjection]* Order. *[interjection]* Order.

Ms. Fontaine: Kevin Klein claims he only worked for Peter Nygård in 2012 and 2014. Those are inaccurate and they're lies, Deputy Speaker.

We've previously shown Kevin Klein worked with Peter Nygård in 2015 and 2016 in St. Kitts and Nevis. Now, new video shows Kevin Klein travelling with Nygård in 2010 to Belize.

Voters in Kirkfield Park deserve to know the truth, Deputy Speaker.

Will the Premier tell Manitobans if she believes—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Fontaine: —her candidate for Kirkfield Park when he says he didn't work for Peter Nygård in 2010 and 2015 and 2016, and I'm—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The member's time has expired.

Mr. Goertzen: Well, no Conservative candidates had to disclose criminal charges; already three that I've tabled for the NDP.

In addition, the current MLA for Flin Flon had to disclose a criminal charge, which I'll table, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Of course, the Leader of the Opposition, the member for Fort Rouge (Mr. Kinew), had to disclose criminal convictions. And, in the last by-election in Thompson, the current MLA also had to disclose criminal convictions.

So, if the new threshold is that if you've worked for someone who has a criminal history, you have to resign, when is the entire NDP caucus going to resign, Mr. Deputy Speaker?

Some Honourable Members: Oh, oh.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order, please. Order. Order.

Government benches, simmer down. Thank you.

Northern Health-Care Services Preventative Foot Care

Mr. Eric Redhead (Thompson): Foot-care service in Thompson has been cut for the past four years. This service is so important to my constituents, especially those with diabetes and the senior population.

Proper foot-care service is critical in preventing amputations.

Will this government invest in foot-care service for Thompson, Manitoba?

Hon. Audrey Gordon (Minister of Health): I'm disappointed that a newly elected MLA is already following through on the narrative that has been set by the Leader of the Opposition to put inaccurate—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon: —information, Mr. Deputy—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Opposition benches.

Ms. Gordon: —Speaker, on the record, but I can correct the record.

Medically indicated foot care is available—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Ms. Gordon: —through the northern regional health authority. There is a process to follow to receive this foot care, and I highly encourage the MLA to find out about that process.

Mr. Redhead: As a matter of fact, I've talked to the CEO of the NRHA. They informed me that preventative health-care—foot-care service is not available.

The foot-care service that the minister is referring to is actually medical foot care—so, after the fact. So, what we're requesting is preventable foot-care service so we don't get to that point.

So, when will this service be restored in Thompson?

Thank you.

Ms. Gordon: I was pleased this summer to be right in Thompson for the northern health-care sustainability summit. Thirty stakeholders were around the table—the table of solutions, Mr. Deputy Speaker—talking about the needs in the North, and specifically in Thompson.

We will continue to listen to these stakeholders and to meet the needs of Manitobans living in the North.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for Thompson, on a final supplementary.

Government Commitment

Mr. Redhead: This government is—has claimed to be throwing around health-care dollars like they're playing the game of Monopoly, and they're telling northern constituents, do not pass go; you're not eligible for preventative foot care or abortion services.

When will this government stop playing games with northerners' health and 'reinstore' foot-care and abortion services for Thompson?

Some Honourable Members: Oh, oh.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. Order, please.

* (14:30)

The clock's still running, folks. We're—it's not my time that's being wasted.

Ms. Gordon: I know why the members opposite are angry. They're angry because our government is sitting at the table of solutions with stakeholders in the North, is investing \$812 million in our clinical preventative services plan, which includes creation of a northern intermediary hub to ensure people living in the North receive care closer to home.

I understand, Mr. Deputy Speaker, there's just too much good news from our government related to the North.

Federal Emergencies Act Inquiry Government Position

Mr. Dougald Lamont (St. Boniface): We want to know why the Manitoba PC government is ignoring

the national inquiry into the Emergencies Act for a convoy organized by yellow vesters, who, as the documents I table show, have been threatening to kill the Prime Minister and other Liberals since at least 2019.

In August 2021, organizer Pat King told followers, quote: I know what's coming and I know what I'm getting prepared for, and I'll tell you right now there's not a single person out there who's effing going to be able to stand up to what's coming. Wait 'til the real bullets start flying.

Yet, this convoy was able to set up a siege outside this building. On February 11th, the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) wrote a letter to the Prime Minister in private, calling for, and I quote, leadership that only you and the federal government can provide. End quote.

If the—only the federal government could help, why did the Premier tell Manitobans it wasn't needed?

Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General): It wasn't needed because Manitoba demonstrated that it wasn't needed, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for St. Boniface, on a follow-up question.

Mr. Lamont: Mr. Deputy Speaker, people's grocery deliveries downtown were cut off; on a highway, slow rollers blocked access to a rural hospital for a senior couple; and medical supplies were delayed at the border.

The Premier and others have said that the police could handle it, but when asked why police weren't enforcing bylaws, the Winnipeg Police Service tweeted that, quote: The charter of rights protects every citizen's right to peacefully gather. This supersedes the traffic act and City bylaws.

That is not the law, not according to the constitution, the Supreme Court or the manual the police say they were using.

That document page, which I table, says: No one has the right to block or disrupt traffic on public highways; the Criminal Code, section 423 (1)(g); see also The Highway Traffic Act.

This is not about politicians directing police operations. We want to know why any police service in Manitoba—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The member's time has expired.

Mr. Goertzen: The blockade that happened at Emerson needed to be removed and the police had negotiations

and were able to remove it without any arrest or violence, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

The blockade, downtown Winnipeg, needed to be removed and the Winnipeg Police Service, through negotiation, were able to remove it without any arrests or violence, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

If that member opposite wants to criticize the Winnipeg Police Service and the RCMP for doing what almost no other police service in Canada was able to do, shame on that member. He's a disgrace for asking that question.

Some Honourable Members: Oh, oh.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order. Order. Order. Order.

An Honourable Member: On a point of—

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable minister of—
[interjection] There are no points of order during question period. Points of order or matters of privilege will be taken up after question period. [interjection]

Order, please. We're going to continue in an orderly fashion.

The honourable member for River Heights has the floor.

Child and Family Services Transition to Adulthood—Homelessness Rates

Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights): Madam Speaker—Mr. Speaker, recent analysis has shown that more than half of those experiencing homelessness has been in the care of Child and Family Services and that the most common age for people to become homeless is 18.

It is tough to live independently when CFS support ends abruptly at age 18. The NDP and PCs have done a terrible job of helping children transition out of CFS care.

I ask the minister responsible: Why is the government so ineffective in helping these children transition successfully to adulthood, and when will the government provide the adequate supports needed to truly make a difference to prevent people from becoming homeless?

Hon. Rochelle Squires (Minister of Families): It is a rare point of agreement between our government and the members opposite who asked this question. We, too, agree that there were too many children in care for too long.

And that is why we transformed child welfare so that we could ensure that families are kept together, that communities are kept together and that we have a strategy for helping young people transition out of the child welfare system into adulthood. That is exactly what our government is doing.

We know that more work needs to be done. We know, under the NDP, they broke the system; they had record high numbers of kids in care; they apprehended a newborn child a day. And we need to fix that broken legacy of the NDP and work towards supporting all of our kids in care and our communities who are suffering the aftermaths of their poor policies.

Substance Abuse Solutions Government Position

Mr. James Teitsma (Radisson): Our government has been working hard to gather evidence-based and outcomes-focused data on mental health and addictions.

Despite the loud and misdirected comments coming from members opposite, the Minister of Mental Health and Community Wellness has paved a way forward for Manitobans living with substance use challenges.

Can the minister please update this House on some of her learnings?

Hon. Sarah Guillemard (Minister of Mental Health and Community Wellness): I do want to thank my friend and MLA for Radisson for that great question.

Some of the learnings we have come across is that 90 per cent of all overdose deaths across Canada are from Ontario, Alberta and BC, all of whom have safe consumption sites. Only one jurisdiction is seeing a reduction in those deaths, and that is Alberta, who has instituted a recovery-oriented system of care and shut down two of their consumption sites.

Even the premier in BC—an NDP premier—is now turning directions and funding, I quote, addictions programs that prioritize detox rather than safe consumption. And I will table that article that quotes him.

Water Management Strategy Privatization Concerns

Ms. Lisa Naylor (Wolseley): Mr. Deputy Speaker, the PC plan is selling public goods for private benefit. Whether it's in our parks or in our health care, they're at it again.

The newly released water strategy calls for increased costs for the public, coupled with privatization.

Why is this government so focused on privatizing everything in the province?

Hon. Jeff Wharton (Minister of Environment, Climate and Parks): It was certainly a pleasure to announce the new water strategy after 20 years, Mr. Deputy Speaker, with the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) just two weeks ago. We know that water, and—every drop is very important.

We know that action needed to be taken, and that's exactly what this government is doing.

Ms. Naylor: Mr. Deputy Speaker, under the PCs, water rates in Brandon are on their way to doubling. But that's not enough; in their own strategy, this government says it wants rate increases while squeezing Manitobans for the benefit of large corporate investors.

Whether it's our parks, our health care and now even our water, the PCs want to take a profit.

Why is this government's only plan the privatization of Manitoba?

Mr. Wharton: It's education time for the member from Wolseley when it comes to water rates, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

We know the NDP like to get involved in Manitoba Hydro and take care—and, matter of fact, double the rates for Manitobans.

Well, Mr. Deputy Speaker, guess what? The PUB sets rates for water consumption throughout the province in 136 municipalities, with the exception of Winnipeg.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for Wolseley, on a final supplementary.

Ms. Naylor: This government sold off Lifeflight. They privatized water bombers. They contracted out a park. They're privatizing health care. Their approach to everything is to hand the public good over for private profit.

* (14:40)

The watered strategy calls for increased rates, coupled with private profit for the delivery of water services.

Why is this government's only plan the privatization of Manitoba?

Mr. Wharton: I suspect the member didn't hear my last response, but I'll try to add to it a little bit so that she understands.

Water is delivered by municipalities, Mr. Deputy Speaker. They have their utilities, they deliver it to their ratepayers on a regular basis. Annually, when they do their budgets, as municipal-responsible municipal governments, who they shout down for 17 years while they were in government, understand what their communities need when it comes to water and utility.

We know that on this House—the Public Utilities Board is responsible for setting rates within all the municipalities within this province with the exception of the city of Winnipeg, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable minister's time has expired.

The honourable member for St. Vital, there's time for one.

University of Manitoba—Dietetics Status of Program for 2023

Mr. Jamie Moses (St. Vital): The PCs are at it again, failing to support Manitoba students.

Their foot-dragging has resulted in the University of Manitoba's dietitian program not being approved for 2023. This means that—in the province, there will not be any new dietitians after June.

This also means that dietitian students will have to finish their education elsewhere, or abandon it and go to a near-'nother' career path. Now, the minister has over five months to approve this program, but he's just dragged his foot with it.

So, can the minister explain why he's failing dietitian students to get educated right here in Manitoba?

Hon. Jon Reyes (Minister of Advanced Education, Skills and Immigration): I wish the member opposite would reach out to their counterparts in BC, an NDP govern that only contributes 32 per cent towards post-secondary revenues, which is 6.6 per cent less than here in Manitoba, while the tuition is 25 per cent higher, and the NDP govern British Columbia, as compared to Manitoba.

And when I speak with many students around the province—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Reyes: —who are choosing to study—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Reyes: —at one of our Manitoba post-secondary institutions, they often tell me that it's because it's one

of the lowest and—affordable programs in Canada. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Reyes: I am proud that Manitoba has one of the lowest tuitions in the country. Our government is listening to post-secondary students, unlike the NDP, who took an ideological approach to post-secondary education during their 17 years—the dark days of the NDP.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable minister—the time for oral questions has expired.

An Honourable Member: On a point of order.

Point of Order

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Minister of Justice, on a point of order.

Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General): During question period, following my response to the honourable member for St. Boniface (Mr. Lamont), the honourable member for St. Boniface decided to give me a hand signal that wasn't indicating that I was No. 1 in his heart, but that was indicating something else, which I won't put on the record. It would be a 'euphem'—or it would be commonly called giving somebody the finger, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Personally, I would say I'm not someone who's easily offended, and I'm not going to classify myself as offended now. The member opposite wants to do this sort of thing outside this Chamber or on the street, I wouldn't be—I wouldn't suggest it or welcome it, but there's something different in this Chamber, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

I'm 20 years into my elected life, and I've—have been called many things in this Chamber and many things have happened. And no doubt I'm closer to the end than the beginning of my elected life, but I am concerned that there are members here who are going to be here much longer than I'm going to be.

And they do deserve to be in a place where they can ask questions, answer questions in an honest and sometimes aggressive way, I understand, without the kind of thing that the member for St. Boniface did. If you want to disagree, you can disagree. If you want to shout at somebody, I guess, to some extent, under your purview, Mr. Deputy Speaker, you can do that. But to do what the member did in terms of what he indicated with his hand is simply inappropriate in a democratic House.

I'm not really doing this on my own behalf because I'm not all that offended personally, but it is not the kind of behaviour that should happen in a democratic House. And for all members—for younger members, electorally and by age, I would hope that they would be able to be in this House for many years without having to experience the kind of behaviour that the member for St. Boniface (Mr. Lamont) conducted today, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable member for St. Boniface, on the same point of order.

Mr. Dougald Lamont (St. Boniface): I welcome the opportunity to respond. I will apologize. I'll put it in context.

I believe that my colleague from Saint Boniface—Saint Vital, Minister Dan Vandal, has given the St. Boniface salute in the past and had to apologize for it in the House of Commons.

But let me make this absolutely clear. When I raise an issue, when people in this House were being threatened, when we had people who were walking into MLAs' offices, when I was getting threats and when we had threats of—death threats being made by convoy supporters, and when the Minister of Justice (Mr. Goertzen) said that it was the Prime Minister who needed to cool down his rhetoric in the face of people who were threatening him with death and had been threatening him with death for three years, and then—and it appeared to me—and it still appears to me—that the minister says that the end justifies the means when it comes to the police misleading Manitobans about the law, I became frustrated.

I will not do it again, and I sincerely apologize.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: On the same point of order, the honourable Leader of the Official Opposition.

Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition): On the same point of order.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition.

Mr. Kinew: I want to begin by saying that I did not witness the gesture directly, though I did see the reaction, and I take the reaction of my colleagues at face value. And, certainly, you know, the apology, I think, affirms what had taken place.

And that is completely inappropriate; that should not take place for reasons that have already been articulated, but also because it represents a gesture of intimidation, because that's a sort of action that

typically precedes an escalation rather than a reasoned conclusion to some kind of disagreement.

I would, of course, ask for your interjection as to whether this may be better dealt with as a matter of privilege, seeing as it does invoke the sort of intimidation but, again, I will leave that to your learned wisdom.

I do, however, want to say, as I understand the emotional reaction from my colleagues on the other side of the House, which is justified in this instance, I do invite you to reflect on other behaviours that took place in this Chamber this week and to encourage us all to understand the sanctity and the sacredness of this hallowed hall. We have to ensure that the conduct in this place is not only of the highest standard for those members here, but also lives up to the principles of democracy to which we all aspire.

And so, I would ask that there not be a double standard when we adjudicate these matters, particularly not on a partisan basis. Everyone deserves to be able to speak here freely. Everyone deserves to be able to participate here fully.

So, certainly, I do sanction and condemn the actions of my colleague from St. Boniface today, but I would be remiss if I did not add those other words to the record.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Do any other members wish to speak?

This matter was raised as a point of order. It will be handled as such.

The member for St. Boniface did apologize. The member for St. Boniface did state that he apologized, and I will take that at face value. That ends the matter. We will continue with the rest of the afternoon.

* * *

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I do want to take the opportunity to remind all of us about decorum, about letting our emotions get out of hand.

I love a lively Parliament, but we can take things too far, and I think that happens on all sides. So, I just want to say, examine yourselves; think about it and we can have all the benefits of this place, including lively debate—I'm not wanting to squash that at all—but, clearly, things can get out of hand and have crossed some lines.

* (14:50)

Let's make sure none of us are contributing to that, either by ourselves, or perhaps by stoking others' unfortunate behaviour.

PETITIONS

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Are there any petitions? I don't see any. *[interjection]*

Thank you, the honourable member for River Heights.

Executive Function Disorder Supports

Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights): I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Individuals with executive function disorders usually associated with a learning disability, ADHD or autism, have a specific deficiency in the executive or adaptive function of their brain.

(2) Individuals with executive function disorders can have a high IQ and can, in some instances, speak as eloquently as a university professor, but often are unable to plan and organize their lives, manage their meals, housing or finances.

(3) Some individuals have an executive function disability in which their executive function develops slowly, requiring that they receive help and support for five to seven years after they turn 18 years old.

(4) Many individuals with executive function disorders can do well in life and at work if given adequate supports and the chance to fully develop their executive function capabilities.

(5) Without that support, they risk becoming homeless, face inconsistent employment and/or could be the victims or perpetrators of crime.

(6) Manitoba has few limited resources specifically to help those with executive function disorders.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the provincial government to partner with organizations that provide individual and group supports and online resources for children, adults with executive function disorders—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order, please. *[interjection]* If we just—if we can just—*[interjection]* Order, please.

I just—*[interjection]* Order. I actually say this for the benefit of the member. If all other members could turn the volume down a little bit, I really can't hear—

and actually, I don't think anybody can—what that member is saying. So, chat, by all means, but please, at a volume that respects the person speaking.

The honourable member for River Heights, please go ahead.

Mr. Gerrard: Yes. Manitoba has few limited resources specifically to help those with executive function disorders.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the provincial government to partner with organizations that provide individual and group supports and online resources for children and adults with executive function disorders and IQs above 75, including:

(a) online videos featuring individuals with executive function disorders raising awareness and explaining in a strength-based way to fully develop their executive function capabilities;

(b) a manual listing all resources for those with executive function defects;

(c) learning modules and instructional videos teaching daily tasks that involve executive function; and

(d) a free online webinar series to enable individuals with executive function deficiencies to access government supports.

(2) To urge the provincial government to improve funding for Community Living disABILITY Services, and other organizations which can provide support for those with executive function disorders in order to reduce wait times for those who need to access them.

(3) To urge the provincial government to recognize that individuals with executive function disorders with a normal-to-high IQ have great potential to be gainfully employed, providing they have some supports, and to set up initiatives to help those individuals get and keep jobs, including a public awareness campaign.

(4) To urge the provincial government to recognize that individuals who are helping those with executive function disorders are essential partners and enable them to accompany the person into a hospital or other situations as necessary, regardless of age.

(5) To urge the provincial government to mandate that all teachers take courses on learning disabilities, including executive function disorders, during their

post-secondary education in order to better understand and educate and end the discrimination that they often experience in the classroom.

Signed by Temple Duncan, Lea Martin, Mars Livingston and many other Manitobans.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Are there any other petitions?

Seeing no further petitions, orders of the day, government business.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

GOVERNMENT BUSINESS

Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader): Resuming debate on the Throne Speech. [*interjection*]

Oh, yes. I have a leave request for the House.

House Business

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The honourable Government House Leader has a leave request.

Mr. Goertzen: Mr. Deputy Speaker, is there leave of the House to waive rule 63 and 64 and to replace the process for dealing with condolence motions in those rules with the following process:

(1) Condolence motions for deceased former members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba shall be called as part of the routine proceedings prior to petitions or matters of urgent public importance if the Speaker has received written notice from a House leader of a recognized party 90 minutes prior to the start of the sitting date.

(2) Written notice to the Speaker should include the names of the deceased members to be commemorated that day, and should be copied to the other House leader, the member for River Heights (Mr. Gerrard), the Clerk and the Deputy Clerk.

(3) The category of condolences will not appear on the daily Order Paper.

(4) For each motion, (a) 10 minutes of speaking time will be allocated to members from the deceased member's political party, (b) five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to the members—to members from another political party, (c) five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to independent members, (d) within those speaking time allocations, the parties or independent members may assign as many members as they wish to speak.

(5) At the conclusion of the speeches, the Speaker shall put the question and ask members to signify their

approval of the motion by rising in their places to observe a moment of silence.

(6) Following the passage of any condolence motion, the Speaker's office shall send to the deceased member's family the Hansard transcript from the sitting day along with a personal letter of condolence from the Speaker, as well as letters of condolence from any other members who are unable to speak during the tribute. Those letters must be received by the Speaker's office when five days of the passage of the motion in the House.

This agreement expires on December 1st, 2022.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: As requested by the honourable Government House Leader, is there leave of the House to waive rules 63 and 64 and to replace the process for dealing with condolence motions in those rules with the following process:

(1) Condolence motions for deceased former members in the legislative—of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba shall be called as part of routine proceedings prior to petitions or matters of urgent public importance if the Speaker has received written notice from the House leader of a recognized party 90 minutes prior to the start of the sitting date.

(2) Written notice to the Speaker should include the name or names of the deceased member or members to be commemorated on that day, and should be copied to the other House leader, the member for River Heights, the Clerk and the Deputy Clerk.

(3) The category of condolences will not appear on the daily Order Paper.

(4) For each motion, (a) 10 minutes of speaking time will be allocated to members from the deceased member's political party; (b) five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to members from another political party; (c) five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to independent members; (d) within those speaking time allocations, the parties or independent members may assign as many members as they wish to speak.

(5) At the conclusion of the speeches, the Speaker shall put the question and ask members to signify their approval of the motion by rising in their places to observe a moment of silence.

(6) Following the passage of any condolence motion, the Speaker's office shall send to the deceased member's family the Hansard transcript from that sitting day along with a personal letter of condolence from the Speaker, as well as letters of condolence

from any other members who are unable to speak during the tribute. These letters must be received by the Speaker's office within five days of the passage of the motion in the House.

This agreement expires on December 1st, 2022.

Is there leave? *[Agreed]*

* * *

Mr. Deputy Speaker: As announced by the honourable Government House Leader (Mr. Goertzen)—*[interjection]*

The honourable Government House Leader.

Mr. Goertzen: Could you please resume debate on the Throne Speech.

* (15:00)

THRONE SPEECH (Sixth Day of Debate)

Mr. Deputy Speaker: As announced by the honourable Government House Leader, we will now resume debate on the Throne Speech, the motion put forward by the honourable member for Borderland (Mr. Guenter) and amendments thereto, standing in the name of the honourable Minister of Labour, Consumer Protection and Government Services, who has 16 minutes remaining.

Hon. Reg Helwer (Minister of Labour, Consumer Protection and Government Services): So I—at the end of the day yesterday, you cautioned me and I won't use the word that you cautioned me on. I'm sorry if I used a word, or I'm sorry I used the word that is deemed to be unparliamentary; at the very best, right on the edge, as you so quote—so stated.

So, sorry to the Legislature, although I do notice that the MLA for St. Johns used the same word today in her question and was not cautioned. So, we'll leave that on the table there, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

But I do hear the litany of misdirection from the members opposite in question period every day and I do have to remind them that during a time where there was no pandemic, when it was under their government, that I spent time visiting my aunt in her hospital bed in St. Boniface, where she was recovering from cardiac surgery in the hallway, Mr. Deputy Speaker, under their watch.

It was hallway medicine and she wasn't counted in the hallway numbers. It was almost like there was a chalk mark on her bed where they would move it and say, okay, the bed moved so that's not in the hallway

medicine count. Despicable, Mr. Deputy Speaker. They forget how horrible health care was under their watch.

And I also spent time in the St. Boniface emergency room, not seated but standing because there was no seat available in the emergency room, waiting with our daughter who'd been brought in by paramedics. And she was in a stretcher on the hall—in the hallway, Mr. Deputy Speaker. Under their watch, health care was despicable.

In fact, the paramedics that day timed out. They had to find a charge nurse to sign off on the care of that patient so that they could leave and actually go back to the hall because they were timing out.

Whereas under our government, Mr. Deputy Speaker—we saw, under their government, their dismal treatment of the kidney clinic in health sciences; a dark, dank hallway. We've replaced that with a bright transplant centre that now patients—that can go to—they can get their lab work done there.

Those are the things that have happened under our government, Mr. Deputy Speaker; not the dark days of the NDP government.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Just before I recognize any other members, I'm obliged to caution the minister regarding reflecting on the Chair.

Any caution given to any member is a caution to all members. No presiding officer is going to catch everything perfectly. Certainly, I think every presiding officer does their best and intends to be even-handed, but any caution to any member is, by extension, to all members.

Possibly, there are times where things go unnoticed, but we do our best and I think there is a legitimate caution regarding reflecting on the Chair.

So, I say that—I'm obligated to say that. I think part of this place running smoothly is that we do that, so.

Mrs. Bernadette Smith (Point Douglas): The Speech from the Throne promised to continue down the catastrophe path of cuts and cruelty that Brian Pallister started on us when he was premier.

At the same time, it completely ignored so many things that Manitobans need, that front-line workers have been asking for and that the research and the experts stand behind.

The speech didn't contain one single mention of social housing or Manitoba Housing or of affordable

housing. The PCs bragged about an affordable package, but they left out even one use of the word renters. Renters in this province are struggling under this government. They haven't mentioned anything about Rent Assist or EIA benefits. How can a plan on affordability leave out Manitobans who need it the most, Deputy Speaker?

I don't know how they can keep a straight face while they just give us a speech that talks about affordability for Manitobans who need financial relief right now. They didn't talk about them at all. Many constituents in Point Douglas are struggling, are homeless, have to use a shelter, have to go to a food bank, have to go stand in a line to get a meal.

Did this government think about those folks? No. They didn't mention anything about them.

Rent has skyrocketed in this province. Did this government support any of those renters? Absolutely not.

Mr. Brad Michaleski, Acting Speaker, in the Chair

People are working one to two jobs just to pay for daycare, just to keep their lights on, and this government continues to raise hydro rates, raise milk. You know, children in our schools need milk. They don't want to feed kids in schools.

And what this government is focused on is making sure that their friends have enough, you know, to continue lining their own pockets and getting richer while the poor and those that are, you know, working, struggling families get poorer and, you know, might end up in that shelter that this government continues to build around.

Deputy Speaker, shelters are not a sustainable way of supporting people in—that need housing. We can't continue to just add shelter beds. We need to build housing, and this government continues to sell off housing. They continue to cut the maintenance budgets for housing. They continue to leave social housing boarded up and have forced Manitobans to actually live in bus shelters in this province.

You know, shame on a government that drives by or walks out this building and can go to sleep at night knowing that someone could freeze to death in this province.

This is the government that we have. You know, these are Manitobans that deserve some support from this government. I was one of those Manitobans. You know, I raised my kids in social housing. I was a single parent. I worked. I went on a bus every morning

to take my kids to daycare, then got on a bus to take my—to go to work, got on that bus again to pick my kids up from daycare, and went back on a bus to my social housing unit.

But I was fortunate enough to actually have a program that our NDP government supported. It was called a Community-based Aboriginal Teacher Education Program. And that's the kind of investments we need a government to make, and that's not going to be this government. That's going to be our NDP government.

When we form the next government, we're going to ensure that we build social programs that this government, in fact, has cut. You know, I look at my own community, Neighbourhoods Alive!, you know, the funding that they cut from that. They forced organizations to be able to match funds 50 per cent, and they couldn't be federal funds; they couldn't be funds that came from the City.

Well, I can tell you, Deputy Speaker, that people in the North End, organizations in the North End, they struggle to get funding. They don't have folks that are, like, in the south end that can, you know, support and give to these kinds of organizations.

So they had to cut staffing. So many people lost their jobs, which meant, you know, they had to, maybe, move out of the community or leave our province. We know that 10,000 people in the last year have left our province. That's 10,000 Manitobans that were spending money in our province in the economy that left here because of this government.

And I don't know how many of those 10,000 were front-line workers in the health-care system, but I imagine there was quite a few of them that left to, you know, Ontario, to Saskatchewan. They were offering, you know, incentives for health-care workers to stay. They were actually treating their health-care workers with dignity, with respect. They were actually giving them collective agreements and not making them wait five years and take them to court. They actually valued their work.

* (15:10)

And during a COVID, you know, when people were struggling, when people were losing their loved ones, people were struggling with online learning, people were struggling with isolation, you know, this government was making cuts instead of investments.

I think about the detox centre that was in—that is at Main Street Project. There used to be 36 beds there

for folks that wanted to, you know, get into treatment. And this government talks about treatment beds. They say they're going to build up to 1,000 treatment beds.

Well, I tell you, Deputy Speaker, people are struggling right now. They need a safe consumption site. They need somewhere where they can get supported and their drugs can be tested so that they don't lose their lives. And this has been proven. Every single safe consumption site right across Canada will tell you, there has not been an overdose death in those safe consumption sites.

This government has taken an ideological approach to it. You know, it's—they look at people who are using drugs as morally failing, that they should just pull their bootstraps up and, you know, get into a treatment centre.

But it's not that easy for some folks. People have been struggling for years with mental health issues. You know, we saw a member of this House today share their experience. We need to make sure that people can access supports and get supports where they need it, not where we want them to be.

You know, ultimately, yes, we'd like people to get into treatment, but not everybody's there. So what about those folks who aren't there? We're supposed to just, you know, not support them and allow them to lose their lives? Families are losing their loved ones. You know, I think about Moms Stop the Harm. I think about those front-line workers that are working with these folks that, you know, they can't even count the amount of people that have died of overdoses in this province. They're holding memorials almost every day while this Province—or, this government turns a blind eye to the crisis that's happening here in Manitoba.

You know, it—they should be able to access health care. You know, addictions support is health care. If you look at safe consumption sites right across our province, they are connected to supports soon as they walk through that door, so they can have their drugs tested, they can use in a safe space. So many of them have used a lot of veins in their body and have, you know, infections, so they can get connected to primary-care providers. There's a lot of blood-borne diseases. We see our babies being born with congenital syphilis. That's a direct result of drug use here in our province. And it's preventable. And our government is doing nothing about it. We have a rise of HIV in this province. That is a result of intravenous drug use.

And is this government helping? No, they're turning a blind eye to it and saying, well, you know what, just go to treatment.

People have trauma. People need to be connected with social workers, with counsellors, with—to even get housing. That's exactly what safe consumption sites do. They have a whole-centred-person approach. It's not about just going in to the safe consumption site and using drugs like this government wants, you know, Manitobans to believe.

It's about connecting people with the resources that they need. It's about saving lives. It's about making sure that Manitobans aren't having to live with HIV. It's about taking some of the burden off of the health-care system and that's exactly what it does.

You know, someone that is prevented by, you know, getting harm reduction supplies in a safe consumption site, that may have HIV, that is not going to use another needle or share a needle, is not going to give another person HIV. If they get support for vein care, they're not going to be accessing the ERs that we know are overloaded because of this government's cuts.

You know, front-line workers are burned out because of this government. You know, we have a vacancy of 2,400 nurses in this province and it's a direct result of this Stefanson government and them continuing to follow Brian Pallister's path. You know, they talk about their strategy; they've just continued the same strategy as Brian Pallister.

And in their original report, there was a safe consumption site in there. And then they took that report back. And then they took that out because Brian Pallister and the rest of the other side didn't believe that Manitobans should have access to health care. And that's exactly what a safe consumption site is.

You know, I think about those folks and I want to go back to housing because I think housing, you know, is a direct correlation to some people having to use drugs. And I've heard this from folks that, you know, they have to stay up all night. There are so many women that I've talked to that can't access shelters because there's only 36 beds for women in shelters. Can you imagine, as a woman, going to a shelter and being turned away, how vulnerable you are? You have to walk the street all night or live in a tent during this frigid cold that we have here in Manitoba?

Does this government care about that? Absolutely not. They don't care about Manitobans who are struggling; they care about their rich folks. You know, they care about people who can afford two-tiered health care, that can, you know, go across the line and get their health care.

Well, Manitobans—not all Manitobans are able to do that. I know I certainly am not. You know, I make a decent wage here, but I also believe in supporting my children and my family and my kids. And my kids are, you know, they're adults now. But I still help, you know, support my kids. I still help to support my grandkids. I still support—you know, I give to the shelter every year. My mom and dad—and I've told, you know, this story—they both used Main Street Project and Salvation Army.

So, I'm thankful for things like that that I can—I have the privilege to help. Many people come to our office that are looking for food. You know, our food banks are overloaded. They don't have enough food. They can't keep up with the demand. We hear this with, right now, the Christmas Cheer Board. You know, over 40,000 more hampers this year than they did last year and the year before. That's just continuing to rise because of this government and their lack of supports for those who actually need it.

They continue just to line the pockets of the people who are wealthy, give big corporations, you know, money that don't even live here in Canada; that aren't even contributing here in Canada; that are making money here, in Manitoba, but live in other provinces. Is that fair to Manitobans? Absolutely not. That money should be staying right here in our province.

I think about education. And, Deputy Speaker, when I was a teacher, you know, I would buy snacks for students. But I'm hearing teachers—all teachers now are having to buy snacks, where that was few and far between. You know, all teachers weren't buying snacks because there wasn't the demand there is now. And it's because of this government's lack of supports. They continue to make cuts to education.

You know, we see Seven Oaks School Division, which I had the privilege to work in for many years, have to cut teachers. Imagine that, Deputy Speaker, having to cut teachers to the supports for kids, who are our future, that need those supports. You know, I think about our special needs students that are included in every classroom, and what supports do they need that this government has cut? So many supports.

And this government says, well, we're investing more, but, you know, we know, in fact, from the front line, from the school divisions themselves that they continue to cut.

And they continue to devalue the education system here—we have here in Manitoba. And, thankfully, Manitobans rose and caught—you know, stopped bill 36 from going through because this government would've decimated the education system. And Manitobans stood up and they said, absolutely not. We're not going to allow this government to do exactly what they did to the health-care system.

And they—continuing to do that, even though health care people on the front line are telling them, We are struggling. Doctors Manitoba, you know, less doctors here in Manitoba. Where are those doctors going? They're leaving our province because of this government.

And, you know, certainly, we will not be supporting this budget. This is, you know, a slap in the face to Manitobans who are struggling and certainly a slap in the face to folks in Point Douglas because we—one just has to drive down Main Street and see the struggle that people are having. And those are Manitobans.

* (15:20)

And I say shame on this government for allowing to—that to happen, for turning a blind eye, for not allowing safe consumption sites and lives to be saved and people to be using and get connected to supports here in our province.

And, you know, I was really disappointed that the Minister for Mental Health and wellness would have the audacity to go to Vancouver and actually photograph folks who were struggling—

An Honourable Member: She told me to go there.

Mrs. Smith: Deputy Speaker, you can go visit there, absolutely, and I have told the minister to go visit there, but I would never, ever take photos of someone who was struggling.

And, you know, we have folks right here in our own backyard that are struggling, and I encourage the minister to go and visit them, but not to photograph them, because that is very disrespectful; it's dehumanizing, and shame on that minister for doing that.

You know what that minister should have been doing? That minister should have been going in that safe consumption site, talking to the folks who are

actually in there, asking them what it is about the safe consumption site that is supporting them and talking to actually the people who are working there, because many of those people that are working there are actually mentors that actually were supported through that safe consumption site and have now turned in—are now supporting other folks because of the support that they received in that safe consumption site.

So, again, I want to say shame on this government for, you know, the cuts that they've continued to make, the lack of supports that they're providing to those who are—that are really struggling in this province, and, you know, lastly, stay away from our education system. You know, invest in it. This is our future. We don't need a government that devalues education in this province; we need a government that's going to value education.

And you can bet when the NDP are in government that we will do just that. It'll take us years to undo what this government has done. They've decimated health care, and they've devalued every single worker on the front lines by slapping them in the face and forcing them to work mandatory overtime, forcing folks to leave Manitoba, and we will not be supporting this budget and, again, shame on this government.

Miigwech.

Mr. Mintu Sandhu (The Maples): It is my honour to rise in the—this Chamber today to put a few words on the record regarding the Speech from the Throne.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I like to thank the wonderful people for The Maples for electing me to this Chamber in 2019. I'm looking forward again to next year, October 3rd, 2023, or the sooner, whenever the election will be called by this PC government, to be their representative again in this Chamber with an NDP government and looking after everyone, equal.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, it is so disheartening to see every single question period this PC caucus and the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) misleading Manitobans on health-care cuts. We don't have to go that far.

Probably some of the members from the PC caucus really don't know where Seven Oaks hospital is. I could give them directions: Memorial Boulevard north, all the way to Leila Avenue. Turn left, and right on the McPhillips and Leila Avenue, there's the Seven Oaks hospital. Used to have a Seven Oaks ER. It's closed. That's health-care cuts.

They also closed Concordia Hospital. Again, if they still need directions, more than happy to provide

them. If they need a ride to there, I'm more than happy to give them a ride, too.

So each and every single day, PC caucus, PC Premier, she's lying to Manitobans.

Sorry, I want to apologize—misleading Manitobans.

The Acting Speaker (Brad Michaleski): Would like to remind the member that you can't use the word lie. Acknowledge that you did make the correction, so we'll say, we'll give the floor back to the member for The Maples.

Mr. Sandhu: As I said, she's misleading every single day.

CancerCare outpatient from Seven Oaks hospital is closed. That's also a health-care cut.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I want to bring it back a little more, because I've recently seen a few MLAs thanking their CAs. I'd also like to thank my CAs.

At my constituency office—I don't know how many people come through the doors of other MLAs. Yesterday, because I knew I will be speaking today, I wanted to confirm how many people come through our doors. That's 25 people every day, average. We are open six days a week.

So I want to thank Aman, who is going to India next Monday—and have a nice trip, Aman. And Sanjit, who is also my CA; Gurbax; Ahandjot. They're doing wonderful work.

What kind of work, probably, Mr. Deputy Speaker, you're wondering, like, if there's a—average of 25 people coming through the doors, what kind of work they are doing every single day. They are starting from PR renewal applications, if somebody wants to apply for citizenship, if they want to apply Canadian passport, if they want to apply a Indian passport, those are the some—a few things that people in my office come for.

Recently, I have seen, Mr. Deputy Speaker, people coming for Manitoba Provincial Nominee Program issues. People are wondering why the scores are so high. Recent draw was around 791. That's pretty high. There are so many people, there are so many international students, who want to apply for Provincial Nominee Program, but because the scores are so high, they can't do it.

One good thing is, this morning, I had a chance to speak to the minister this morning, and he clarified that new draws will be lower and it will be quicker,

because last time, two months, there was no draw at all.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, another thing that people are coming to my office recently are student aid. There is a big delay on student aid, and students have to start their education, but the decision is not made if they will qualify for the student aid.

And also, Mr. Deputy Speaker, we have seen recently that the PC government will be spending around \$200 million to recruit health-care professionals. It's always, like, have seen so many times—this is not the first time that they have did an announcement. Has they followed through those announcements? No, they haven't.

* (15:30)

There are so many—actually, I'd like to highlight a few of the things that they have misleded.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, they closed CancerCare locations at Seven Oaks and Concordia, a new facility for CancerCare Manitoba, a personal-care home in Lac du Bonnet.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, actually, when I came to mind the Lac du Bonnet, I think just before 2016 elections, the PCs announced that they will be building new 1,200 PCH beds. Did they follow through on that one? No, they didn't. How many beds there are? There's 216 less beds today than what they were in 2016 for PCH beds.

So it's very hard to believe if this PC government is going to follow through any of their announcements, especially when this is an election year. We are less than a year away. Is any of the programs they're announcing, any of—will have any effect? No, they're just announcements only. We will not going to see any positive effect, any of this.

So, Mr. Deputy Speaker, I know, I'm kind of—I was under the weather since last Thursday. Want to really speak today, so came to the session, but my request is to this—all the members in this Chamber and also those people who are listening: please wear a mask when you can, especially inside the Chamber here or when you are indoors. This is serious. I was really, really sick. I didn't know what is happening. And at one moment, I will be burning hot and the next moment I will be really, really cold. I'm finally feeling really well right now, but still, please, let's protect our kids; let's protect our seniors; let's protect each other.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas-Kameesak): Thank you, Mr. Acting Deputy Speaker—am I correct? It's always a member—it's always an honour to stand here as the member for The Pas-Kameesak.

When I first started this journey here in 2015, my communities grew from 10 communities to 17 when the boundaries changed in 2019. At first, anyone could address this with a little bit of intimidation but I, myself, welcomed it with open arms because that just meant getting to know new communities, getting to make more friends and getting to be more stronger as a representative.

And I can honestly say I've been here for seven years, and I honestly thought, you know, when debates first started, I couldn't do more than five minutes. And I used to look at everyone here in awe and go, how, how can they do their full 30? Now I understand why. After seven years here, I sometimes have to get the plug pulled on me. I can't stop talking about what is going on in this province, and my wonderful colleagues here give me great narrative to run with it.

But the favourite narrative that I love most of all is talking about my own backyard, northern Manitoba. And that's why I bought forward a very important resolution about a very important lack of service that we do not have in northern Manitoba, which is psychiatric assessments for children. And within the Throne Speech, not much has been bought up with that. And just imagine the entire population of children that are not being addressed in northern Manitoba and rural Manitoba to have this important assessment done.

Currently, my 17-year-old, because of this lack assessment, is suspended from school. So, therefore, you know, when a parent gets a phone call such as this morning, your child is—has been suspended, and because this is the lack of services that this poor young woman needs, and the only way this can be done, if the RCMP intervenes.

Now, just imagine if we lived in a wonderful world where this service was available in The Pas, I wouldn't be here as a stressful mother wondering what's next, right? So, these services need to be provided for our children in northern Manitoba because it's just going to drive families and children into darker areas in their life, right? Like, imagine a family going through a crisis but the next available service is probably six hours away and six months away. All right?

So, that is what my goal is to do, to advocate for these services for northern Manitoba and—because this was not even aimed or even think of—thought of as important within the Throne Speech.

Another thing that I wanted to bring up is the provincial government, they fail to outline how will they reduce the number of Child and Family Services care and support who are currently in the system. I can truly, truly speak to this personally as a foster mother and dealing with the service that do not truly believe in reunification.

I find that the children in care files are far more massive than the little, probably, couple of files of reuniting families thoroughly. I honestly believe that it's much more easier to apprehend, and it's harder work to get a whole family together, especially when you're dealing with addictions and depression and suicide. That's tough work.

So we need to change that mentality within the system, and the training and whatever lack of training that we currently have within this system. Like, we have people are not even trained who are making decisions, playing God with families of who and when gets to have their children. That mentality has to stop because it's destroying families, it's driving children to quit school, get into crime. And that is why we have this pathetic cycle that we used to go through for residential school; now it is the CFS system that the cycle is going through.

And another thing that I wanted to talk about was the—fail to mention the start of the Lake Manitoba-Lake St. Martin channels project. As a representative for our communities within the Interlake, right from the beginning, right from the get-go, this project has had problems.

For example, you forgot a major stakeholder: the communities that are actually affected. They were not talked about, they were not even, you know, a part of the plan. You know, was there employment even offered? You know, instead of these other companies always guaranteed these contracts, right? But the people here, all they want to be—all they wanted to be is to be included within the decisions, right? That is what your phantom consultation process looks like, right?

And consultation is way more than sitting down and having a meeting. Consultation is true partnership. Consultation is actually having an Indigenous community with a solid seat at the table with decision

making and benefits dripping down to the communities. Right now, we see nothing.

And another thing I want to talk about is the importance of an expansion of broadband services in rural and northern Manitoba. And—*[interjection]*—exactly. You know, some of these communities that I have to go into, I have to let my chief of staff know, and my own staff know, I'll be off the radar for the whole afternoon, right?

So, being within these communities, you know, the—you know, yes, there's, you know, Internet, you know, for education and all that, but what about safety? You know, for safety issues and whatnot, because I remember when the pandemic happened in Moose Lake, we had the army, you know, services going there, but there was no Wi-Fi, no Internet connection—*[interjection]*

* (15:40)

The Acting Speaker (Brad Michaleski): Order.

Ms. Lathlin: —we had to communicate through walkie-talkies. And so, with that, it's a safety issue as well.

So, another thing I wanted to bring up is health-care services, particularly eye-care services. I'm really looking forward to this breakfast that we all got an invitation to regarding diabetic eye health.

Like I said, I'm currently going through health care for my own eyes. I'm a diabetic. I have to get injections and laser treatment in order for my sight not to get worse. And even these can't even help at the moment until my treatment is done.

And I have people who are my age, at the age of 46, who are blind. They chose to go blind because the services are not offered to—where they live. They're afraid of the services. They can't afford the services. And they just chose to go blind.

People my age are choosing to do that because of the point of not having a vehicle to come down here—*[interjection]*

The Acting Speaker (Brad Michaleski): Order.

I would just like to remind the House, the member for The Pas-Kameesak has the floor.

The level of conversations are getting fairly high. So, if you could take a—drop it down a notch or take it to the loge, that would be much appreciated.

Ms. Lathlin: Thank you very much for that.

So, with closing, I just want to talk about that particular service I was talking about. You know, I'm looking forward to attending that breakfast with the optometrist—I believe it's on Monday morning—and talk about how can we work together and people across—to ensure that these services can be provided.

You know, we need incentive for somebody to go up there or a couple of people to go up there to provide these services. And this is very important because, when we talk about northern Manitoba, we're talking about a high population of diabetics. That is my—that is why my good friend, the MLA for Thompson, is begging for that foot-care clinic to be back in Thompson.

Did you know that Opaskwayak Cree Nation has the highest rate of amputations in northern Manitoba—in Manitoba altogether? And also, with that, with the foot-care clinic, you know, without that preventative stage of care, we're going to contribute to that high number of amputations.

And as a diabetic myself, shoot, I would hate to be living there, you know, as a diabetic. I would be protecting my feet and terrified if anything happened to them because I would probably have to travel to Winnipeg. Okay, do I have money in my bank account? Do I have a vehicle? Do I have a place to stay there? Am I going to be able to eat, you know?

So these are challenges that we face. And, unfortunately, these challenges are overbearing where we just neglect the health care. We can't make it to our appointments so we're getting sicker and sicker and sicker, the more that these folks ignore our cries for health-care services.

So, with that, Mr. acting deputy services—Mr. Acting Deputy Speaker, again, it's an absolute honour to be standing here to put my issues on record. I speak from the heart. I speak for the people.

And I again, too, want to emphasize the importance of our role here in this room. We always have to conduct ourselves with the utmost respect. We always have to conduct ourselves with the dignity that we deserve.

You know, every single one of us here worked very hard to get here. It was a tough time to get here, some of us—thin—our skin had to get thicker. I can truly tell you mine is thick since I arrived here at 2015. But it still doesn't mean that I still can't get hurt in here. Okay? So, every single member here needs to understand that.

Look at each other. Don't think everything is just fine on the face value. No. We have a lot of stuff going on back home and we leave our families, such as me, to come here and deal with this, when I would probably want to be at home right now dealing with my kid who just got suspended from school, right?

So, with our time here, respect each other. Think about the hard work we all pulled to get here, and don't forget that.

So, have each other's back. I don't care where we're sitting here on this political spectrum that we have here. But take care of each other and respect each other. And that's what I want to leave my words on record.

Ekosi.

Mr. Matt Wiebe (Concordia): Mr. Deputy Speaker, I appreciate the opportunity to rise and to put a few words on the record with regards to this year's Throne Speech.

You know, I just wanted to say, Mr. Deputy Speaker, you know, politics is a tough, you know, occupation—or, a tough endeavour. There's a lot of really difficult decisions that we need to make on a daily basis. There's a lot of really nuanced positions that we often take and that we need to sort of navigate on behalf of our constituents. And I do think that most of us come to this place in a very honest and thoughtful way and do try to navigate those in the best way for our constituents.

But, oftentimes, you know, the challenge in this job is communicating those positions in a way that folks can understand, that makes sense to them. And, you know, not everything gets communicated very clearly. Sometimes there's, as I said, there's nuance; there's grey areas; it can be very difficult to do that.

What's really nice in politics is when there's a very clear black and white that is presented to the people of Manitoba. And I feel like that's the opportunity that we got in this Throne Speech because for years we've had a government that has been on this slow but very steady—well, sometimes not so slow, but very steady march towards privatization in so many different areas of government. They've been on the march to cut, to strangle, to take the air out of some of the most important public institutions that we have in this province and in this country.

And they've been doing that sometimes—as I said, sometimes quickly, sometimes slowly, but always trying to say, no, no, no, no, that's not what we're

doing; actually, don't you know, we're spending more money that's ever been spent ever in the history of the universe, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

That's what they say. We know it's not true, but that's what they've been saying. And they've been trying to bamboozle the people of Manitoba to think that they are actually not trying to cut and privatize our institutions.

Then we get an opportunity like this Throne Speech where we have a Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) who, you know, takes off the mask, who doesn't try to hide it anymore and comes out very clearly to the people of Manitoba and says, I want to privatize health care in Manitoba.

And if she thinks that that is the winning message that she's going to go to the people of Manitoba with, I encourage her to do that, because every single member on this side of the Chamber, day in and day out, whether it's in Concordia, whether it's in Transcona, whether it's in Kirkfield Park, we will say every single day, we believe in public health care in this province and across this country, and so do the people of Manitoba and across Canada.

You know, the list—and I was hoping I'd have more time here, Mr. Deputy Speaker, because the list we have is a mile long—of the areas in which this government has cut and privatized already. But I just wanted to point out a few points that I think really highlight the impact that privatization can have.

You know, I have been spending a lot of time in Kirkfield Park. You know, it is a by-election going on, but I really enjoy being out there and talking to the people in that community, because they do care. They are people who care deeply about health care, about their cost of living. You know, it's easy to paint people with one brush. It's easy to say, well, you know, isn't that a Conservative voting area.

Well, first of all, I would take issue with that because we, of course, had a very good MLA who many in this Chamber would know, Sharon Blady, represented those fine, fine folks. But it's easy to just say well, that's a Conservative household, right, or that's somebody who always votes Conservative. But I take the time, Mr. Deputy Speaker. I knock on the door and I say, you know, tell me your story. Let's hear what matters to you.

And, you know—you would be—I'd be very surprised how many people come to me and say I'm a health-care worker; my daughter's a nurse; you know, my husband's a doctor. You know, across the board,

we get people who work in health care who are telling us they see the effects day in and day out of the privatization and the use of agency nurses in the case of this couple I just talked to the other day. They see the impact that that's taking resources away from the public system and it's pumping it into the private system.

* (15:50)

And we have a Premier who stands up and says, I'm proud of that; I'm proud to spend more in the private health-care system; I'm proud that we're sending people out of this province down to the United States; I'm proud that during our darkest hour during the COVID pandemic, our cuts—that is, the government's cuts—and the privatization that had already been done led to so many people being shipped out of our province—some of our sickest people being shipped out of our province. It's absolutely shameful, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Cuts have consequences. When we stood up in 2016 and we said, don't close our ERs, don't close Misericordia, don't close the Concordia ER and the Seven Oaks ER, this government said, well, they're just fear mongering, this is—well, they're just making it up.

We're living the experience, now, of those cuts. We are living the consequences of those cuts, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

And you know, the—and the chickens have come home to roost for this government. And now they say, well, oh, well the—don't worry, we'll fix it. Trust us. Trust us, they say. They broke it, Mr. Deputy Speaker. We, the NDP, will be the ones to fix it once again.

You know, very briefly because I do want to give time to our brand new MLA for Thompson. And if I can just take a quick second while I have the floor to say what an amazing addition he's been to our team and what a great representative of what we should be doing here, bringing issues that are important to his constituents to the floor of this Legislature. And we get the spin back, but, you know, what he's asking are real questions that actually affect his constituents, so I just wanted to quickly point that out.

Very briefly, Mr. Deputy Speaker, the other thing I'm hearing on the doorstep in my own community, I'm hearing it every single door that I knock across this city and across the province, I've been a lot of places lately. I'm looking forward to being all over the place going forward. But we're hearing the issues of crime. We're hearing the issues of homelessness. We see it

on our streets and it's not right. It's not right what's happening to our most vulnerable people in this province. They have no choice but to be on our streets. And that's not right.

We brought forward a plan: the Houston model, it's been used elsewhere. You know, not exactly the socialist bastion down there in Texas, but we know that we can see examples where it's worked. We know that safe consumption sites work, we can go to the evidence. We're not making this up.

You know, it's the Minister of Justice (Mr. Goertzen) who took that report and he ripped out that page. We got the real report that said safe consumption sites were a part of the solution, but he ripped that out because, I guess, members in his caucus said that they needed to be ideological about this. We won't be, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

While we're losing housing in our city, while we're seeing our most vulnerable who are struggling, we need real answers. We need real steps that we can take. We've put forward that plan. Manitobans will get a chance—as I said, absolutely black and white. We are standing for publicly owned health care. We're standing on the side of our most vulnerable. We will do that every single day, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

And I'm glad that the Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) is taking the mask off. She's out in the open now. She's making sure that everybody understands where she stands. We're going to be clear. We're going to send that message. And we're looking forward to bringing that to the doorsteps of Manitobans hopefully very soon.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Eric Redhead (Thompson): It's an honour to stand here for the first time and respond to the PC's last Throne Speech.

So I want to thank the constituents of Thompson for allowing me to be here today. And I want to thank my colleagues who have been a tremendous support throughout this learning curve for me in my recent change in career. Each and every one of them have been very supportive, and I appreciate that.

I want to also thank my family for putting up with the long days and—away from home and all these other issues that come with this role. Nonetheless, I am honoured and I know my family is very proud of this today, so thank you.

So, you know, I want to talk a little bit about the Throne Speech—obviously, that's why I'm here—and

the issues that need to be addressed that weren't addressed in the Throne Speech. You know, Thompson and the North have been neglected for many, many years by this government, and that Throne Speech proved that again this year.

You know, when we're talking about health-care services, this is vital to our families, to our region, to our communities. And the lack of services that are provided in the North, in Flin Flon, in The Pas—all over the North—is shameful, right.

I mean, you know, when my constituents call me, saying, look, we need foot care; we need access to abortion clinics. These are the issues that the Throne Speech did not address, right? And we're here today to bring that to light, and the shamefulness of that—the lack of access to these services for the North. And so I wanted to put that on record.

You know, it's not only that, but the Northern Patient Transportation Program is—it puts—it's still there apparently, right? I mean, I get calls from the office that people aren't able to access that service or they're denied it. Where an elder who's an amputee has to take a bus out of their own—or, pay out of their own pocket—take a bus from Thompson to Winnipeg—that's an eight-hour drive on a bus. They're denied a flight because of the cuts that this government has put on the North. That's shameful, right?

And I remember a few years ago, it wasn't even that long ago where it was recommended that an elder take a flight rather than take a bus when accessing medical services down in Winnipeg. What happened to that elder? They died on that bus of a heart attack. I don't know if you guys remember this but this just happened, right? And that shows the deep impacts that the Throne Speech has on northerners' health. I mean, that's shameful.

That's—we're talking about people's lives. And when we're talking about people's lives, there's families, right? There's—it goes on and on.

And so, I wanted to bring health care up. And again, you know, even Thompson General still struggles with hot water issues. I still get calls that the hot water goes out from time to time and that health-care aides are still lugging up water—boiling water and—to give patients a bath. That's still happening—*[interjection]*—yes, I get calls from that from time to time, even after it was claimed to be fixed by this government. That's shameful.

I mean, I've had calls from members who went months without a proper bath in the hospital—months.

All they had to do—they get a sponge bath. And, you know, this is 2022. Since when is that acceptable? You know, if your hot water goes out in your house, you're going to fix it, but if it goes out in a northern community with a prominently Indigenous population, well, that can wait.

And then, talking about some Indigenous issues, I wanted to bring up the fact that, you know, over the past six years the PCs have been in office, and they've failed to implement the reconciliation strategy despite the legal obligation to do so, right? Legal obligation to do this.

In my capacities before I became MLA, I've met with various ministers on reconciliation, and I can say that there was no dialogue. It was a dominated conversation by the other side, right? And so it's—that's the approach that they want to take to reconciliation. I was so disheartened by that, I decided to run for MLA for the NDP to help address that issue.

And so, it's this type of behaviour that—why I'm here today to try and change for the betterment of Manitobans, for the betterment of the North. And they're still not listening; they're still chatting over there, despite the fact that, you know, we're talking about Indigenous issues. But that just goes to show the type of narrative that this government wants to implement, right? And it's very shameful.

* (16:00)

And, you know, I have four children that I'm raising by myself as a single father. I want them to grow up in a respected environment where they have access to child care, they have access to health care, they have access to quality education. This Throne Speech does none of that, right? And it doesn't even address the cost of living.

So, it's—I just wanted to point that out, that's it's a very, very shameful Throne Speech from this government, and very happy that it's their last.

Thank you.

Hon. Alan Lagimodiere (Minister of Indigenous Reconciliation and Northern Relations): They always say you save the best for last. I'm not sure what they mean when they say you're second last. I don't know what they would call you with that.

So, anyway, the Throne Speech has reaffirmed our government's commitment to advancing reconciliation. And we are continuing our whole-of-government approach to advancing key reconciliation initiatives, including economic reconciliation.

As the Minister for Indigenous Reconciliation and Northern Relations, I am pleased to share what our government is doing to advance reconciliation. The Premier (Mrs. Stefanson) of Manitoba and this government, non-Indigenous and Indigenous Manitobans have worked hard in advancing reconciliation since the Premier took office in November of 2021.

And this work remains a priority for our government as we highlighted as one of the seven top commitments. The other commitments were: helping make communities safer; helping families make ends meet; strengthening health care and reducing surgical and diagnostic backlogs; helping make Manitoba more competitive; yes, helping protect our environment, climate and parks; and helping build stronger communities.

Mr. Andrew Micklefield, Deputy Speaker, in the Chair

Each and every one of these commitments in the Throne Speech touches on and advances reconciliation as we engage with Indigenous people in actioning these priorities. Reconciliation is now inherent in the actions of every government department as they directly affect every Manitoban.

To make communities safer, our government is investing \$1.7 million in N'Dinawemak—Our Relatives' Place, and Indigenous-led community resource offering 24-7 warming space. This investment will ensure there's a warm place for those in need this winter season.

Addressing violence against women and girls, and the incidents of missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls remains a priority for this government. We are committed to release the first progress and update to the gender-based violence framework that will be released in the coming months.

Our government is also making downtown safer by extending a \$3.6-million grant to the Downtown Community Safety Partnership.

Our government is helping all Manitobans, including Indigenous families, make ends meet by introducing an \$87-million family affordability package. This was introduced to help all families with children, seniors and vulnerable Manitobans. No distinctions have ever been made between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Manitobans. This is as it should be, focused on equality, and we are delivering.

We're helping all Manitoban families by giving affordability cheques to all families and children under the age of 18; \$250 will be given to the

first-born child, and \$200 for each additional child. This is helping Manitobans during an historic inflation crisis, some of which is the result of the federal Liberal-NDP alliance, which affects affordability and the economy.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we want to help all Manitoban families during these difficult times, and we know providing these funds to Manitobans will help relieve some of these stresses.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we are strengthening health care and reducing surgical and diagnostic backlogs for all Manitobans, including the NDP. We are doing this in an approach that focuses on reconciliation. We have committed millions for health care outside of Winnipeg. We are taking the necessary steps to provide health care closer to home because Manitobans deserve this.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I have recently been involved in discussions 'incomparing' addictions and the suicide crisis in northern Indigenous communities. This national crisis requires strong leadership and collaboration from all levels of government. Our government continues to build on our existing road map for mental health and wellness. We will complete and implement a provincially co-ordinated strategy for suicide prevention, focusing on youth and at-risk communities, including First Nations and Indigenous communities.

We are committed to collaborating with Indigenous communities, leadership and federal government to improve wellness and mental health. We are committed to end substance abuse and provide needed addictions services and programs in Manitoba. This is a priority for our government.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, the Throne Speech points out that we are helping make Manitoba more competitive and are focused on strategic investments to support economic growth. Our government created the Communities Economic Development Fund that will support northern economic development by providing a reliable source of capital for northern business development. The CEDF will soon re-open its business loan program to support key sectors of northern Manitobans' growing economy, which will benefit many of our northern relations' businesses and communities.

We have invested \$74 million in the Hudson Bay rail line, which will not only ensure continued rail service to northern and remote communities, but will build a multi-modal transportation hub and trade gateway that will attract increased investments in the Port

of Churchill, the closest Canadian port to Europe, creating jobs and business opportunities, not only in North, but all of North America. The Port of Churchill is a jewel that was overlooked by the NDP for their entire 17-year term. Instead of coming up with a sustainability plan—

An Honourable Member: No plans.

Mr. Lagimodiere: None. The NDP decided it was better to provide handout funding, making the port dependent on continued government handouts for survival. We know and support the importance of northern Manitoba in the future of Manitoba, and are taking action to give the hand up needed for a vital, sustainable port that can serve all of North America.

Unlike the NDP members' leave-it-in-the-ground policies, we are working hard to regain our reputation as a leading world mining jurisdiction. *[interjection]* Okay. We are working hard to regain our reputation as a leading world mining jurisdiction—we recently announced \$5 million to improve and modernize systems that support mineral development and exploration and mining in Manitoba. *[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mr. Lagimodiere: We will help streamline regulatory processes and enhance department's internal capacity to meaningful consultation and engagement with First Nations and Métis communities.

Mr. Jim Maloway (Elmwood): Very pleased to make a few comments on the Speech from the Throne.

And, you know, I recognize that an election might be coming pretty soon, maybe sooner than we think. Hopefully we'll be back here in March.

But there's some issues—some consumer issues—that the government should be paying some attention to. I know they did step up on the catalytic converter issue and—you know, and we pushed that along. But there's some new issues that are coming up.

* (16:10)

And, actually, in the last little while, we've seen quite a few articles on the market adjustment fees in the auto industry. I read, across Canada, people are having trouble buying new cars and dealers have taken advantage of consumers by requiring them to buy all of the extra warranties and rust-proofing and other things that are normally options that consumers do not have to buy. Now, if they don't buy these things, they're told they can't have the car.

So it's incumbent upon this government to—there's a minister in charge here, somewhere. The minister should be, you know, taking this up with the—well, actually, it's a violation of the federal Competition Act, to start with. But they should be looking at that angle there, and they should also be looking at the consumer legislation.

In Ontario's case, there's legislation there where the government can remind the dealers that they cannot do, or should not be doing stuff like this, basically forcing the consumers to pay way more for cars than they should have to.

So, you know, there's other issues, too. Like, in the United States we have President Biden, over a year and a half ago, made an announcement under the jobs—the big jobs fund for America to replace lead pipes in 10 million US households. And, you know, in Canada, we have federal guidelines that came out with lead level requirements, 2019. So the government's got to be aware of this. President Biden is a year and a half ahead of this government on this particular issue.

And we have, you know, several thousand houses in my constituency, in other constituencies in this province, and the City knows where they are. I can't get a list of them, because they'll only give the information to the owners of the houses. So, the government should be involved with the municipalities, City of Winnipeg and other municipalities, in working out a system where homeowners can get help in replacing these lead pipes.

So, you know—Mr. Deputy Speaker, you know, I don't want to slow down the process here. I know we've all got to get places. So, I'm going to—yes, I've got other things to say about this as well, but we can do that in the future.

So, thank you very much, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Hon. Heather Stefanson (Premier): It's an honour for me to rise in the Chamber today to put a few words on the record with respect to the Throne Speech that was introduced to Manitobans last week by Her Honour Anita Neville. And I want to thank her for everything that she does in the province of Manitoba.

I want to start off today by thanking all of my colleagues. I know that they have been out in their constituencies, they have been listening to Manitobans. And we're taking action based on what we are hearing out in our communities. And this Throne Speech is really about what we heard from Manitobans and what their priorities are.

We heard loud and clear, Mr. Deputy Speaker, that Manitobans want us to help make our communities safer. They want us to help families make ends meet. They want us to strengthen health care and reduce the surgical and diagnostic backlogs. They want us to help make Manitoba more competitive, and they want us to help protect our environment, our climate and our parks. And they want us—to 'helb' us build stronger communities. And, of course, advance reconciliation.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, that is what we have heard loud and clear from Manitobans. Our government will continue to listen to and to work with Manitobans, to accomplish our shared goals together.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, this upcoming year, Manitobans will be asked to make an important choice about the future of our province. They will be asked to choose between the positive and forward-looking vision of our Progressive Conservative team and the divisive and misguided ideology of the NDP. The Leader of the Opposition outlined that ideology in his—*[interjection]*

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Order.

Mrs. Stefanson: —remarks to the Speech from the Throne.

First, he said he would eliminate all private provision of health care in Manitoba and stop Manitobans from receiving needed surgeries and tests out of province, Mr. Deputy Speaker. Former premier Gary Doer and other moderate New Democrats have historically supported contracting out with the private providers under a universal, publicly funded system. They have supported it because they know that contracting with private providers makes our public health-care system better and more accessible for Manitobans.

Make no mistake, this is not a Gary Doer NDP opposition. The Leader of the Opposition's misguided ideology would result in more people waiting for care increasing pandemic backlogs and leaving Manitobans to suffer needlessly. That is not what Manitobans want, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

The Leader of the Opposition and his party also want to raise taxes on Manitoba families. It's what they have done every time they have been in government, and it is what they will do again if given the chance, Mr. Deputy Speaker. When they were in government they broke their promise to Manitobans and raised the PST, taking \$325 million out of the pockets of hard-working Manitoba families. And in opposition

they have voted against every single tax relief measure that we have brought forward for Manitobans.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, they have opposed cumulative tax relief of \$2,400 for average Manitobans and \$4,800 for the average two-income family. Unlike the NDP's ideological agenda, our vision outlined in this Throne Speech will make Manitoba stronger, it will make Manitoba safer, and it will make Manitoba more affordable.

With the price of essentials like gas and groceries going up, we know that families need help now, and we are responding to those needs. In the spring we announced a continuation of our plan to eliminate education property taxes on residential and farm properties, increasing the Education Property Tax rebate to 37 and a half per cent. Next year, as announced in the Throne Speech, the rebate will grow to 50 per cent, putting \$700 more in the pocket of the average Manitoban.

We also announced our \$87-million Family Affordability Package this summer, providing the average Manitoba family with \$450 and low-income seniors with \$300 to help with the cost of gas, with the cost of groceries and other essentials. And what did members opposite do about that? They voted against it, Madam Speaker—or Mr. Speaker.

And Manitoba Public Insurance has provided \$500 million in rebates to Manitoba drivers, including an average rebate of \$700 per vehicle for Manitobans.

Our Throne Speech commits to providing even more relief from rising costs, and we will continue to do everything we can to reduce the cost of living and help families make ends meet. We have been listening to Manitobans. We are taking action and we are getting the job done on their behalf.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we have all seen the recent rise in crime in Manitoba, including a significant uptick in violent crime. I said it publicly just a few weeks ago, and I will say it again, enough is enough; we are taking action. This year's Throne Speech continues to make that important point. It offers a balanced approach that gets tough on violent offenders while addressing the root causes of crime.

* (16:20)

Over the last month, we have announced \$15 million for Manitoba's first-ever homelessness strategy; \$3.2 million for an intensive bail supervision and high-risk warrant enforcement unit to crack down on the most dangerous repeat violent offenders throughout

Manitoba; and \$3.6 million for the Downtown Community Safety Partnership providing eyes and ears on the streets of downtown Winnipeg.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, these measures will help address the root 'causes' of crime. They will help make our communities safer. They will protect the most vulnerable people in our communities and it will keep the high-risk offenders off our streets.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, our Throne Speech promises to improve the safety and well-being of our entire province. Through improvements to technology, to training and increased police presence, we will make Manitoba safer.

We all know the pandemic created challenges in our health-care system, including a significant backlog in surgeries and diagnostic tests. Over the last year, we established a diagnostic and surgical task—recovery task force that has reduced the backlog for several procedures, including significant progress in cataract surgeries and hip and knee replacements. Mr. Deputy Speaker, we are making progress so that Manitobans can stop waiting and start living.

We have invested \$812 million to build, expand and fix health-care facilities in every region of our province. And our Throne Speech commits to a new multi-year, multi-billion-dollar capital investment in our hospitals right here in our capital city in Winnipeg.

On this side of the House we know that health-care staffing is just as critical as system capacity. To increase nursing capacity we committed and then surpassed our goal of adding over 400 nursing seats to our post-secondary institutions.

And our government is investing \$200 million in a plan to retain and to train and to recruit more than 2,000 health-care professionals across our great province. And I can tell you, Mr. Deputy Speaker, it was an honour to stand with the Minister of Health (Ms. Gordon) just a couple of weeks ago, along with Doctors Manitoba, along with nurses, along with those in our health-care fields where we have been listening to those on the front line as to what is needed out there. We have been listening to them, we are taking action and we are getting things done for those in our province.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we recognize that there's more work to be done, and that's why we will always put patient care first and we will never allow ideology to get in the way of patient care in our province.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, our government believes that Manitoba is poised to lead the country in economic growth. We are creating jobs and attracting investments like never before in this great province of ours. Our GDP is projected to grow by 3.6 per cent this year, and we have experienced significant rebounds in retail sales, in manufacturing sales and in farm cash receipts. We have gained over 55,000 full-time jobs in many of our key industries, from agriculture processing, to mining, to film and television production, all are expanding rapidly right here in this beautiful province of ours.

Earlier this month, Mr. Deputy Speaker, we announced a new water management strategy, and I want to thank the minister for bringing that forward. It was great to be with him at that announcement along with many of my colleagues. This is one of the most important things we can do in our province, the first of its kind in almost 20 years and a critical blueprint for managing our abundant water resources effectively as our economy grows.

As the minister said just today in question period, in response to a question from members opposite, it's important to note that every drop of water counts and we will ensure that we implement this water management strategy. It's absolutely critical for economic development and for our province, Mr. Deputy Speaker, so very excited to be a part of that.

We invested \$50 million in a new venture capital fund and we have already received \$100 million worth of private sector enquiries looking to invest in Manitoba alongside that fund. That is going to be so exciting for the future growth opportunities right here in this beautiful province of ours.

And we have re-energized our mining sector, approving our first potash mine and investing \$10 million in the Manitoba Mineral Development Fund to support this critical industry here in Manitoba. I—we were at one point No. 1 in the world when it comes to mining in our province and we have—we've slipped behind, but we are going to be No. 1 again, you mark my words, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Our central location and proximity to the United States make us a potential hub for continental trade. Hudson Bay and the Port of Churchill give us unique access to global markets. This year, we announced \$1.5 billion to support Manitoba's trade and commerce grid, and the Winnipeg One Million Perimeter Freeway Initiative ensuring the efficient movement of

goods along key trade corridors. We recently announced a \$40-million commitment in the expansion and future development of CentrePort South, North America's largest inland port and foreign trade zone.

And we are investing over \$73 million in upgrading the rail line to Churchill, enhancing our export capacity at a critical time for the global economy. And one day, soon, Mr. Deputy Speaker, western Canadian exporters from the Rocky Mountains to Hudson Bay will have secure access to global markets, right here, in Manitoba.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, we are working to grow our economy. We are working to attract investment and we are working to create good jobs for Manitoba families right across this great province of ours. Manitobans will have a choice to make this coming year. They can choose the NDP's ideological agenda, which offers a higher cost of living, which offers more crime on the streets in our communities across this province and a stagnant economy. I don't think that's what and we don't think that's what Manitobans want.

The other choice they have is, they can choose our positive vision for a Manitoba which offers a life of affordability, which offers a safer streets in our communities and good jobs right here in Manitoba, Mr. Deputy Speaker. *[interjection]*

Keep clapping.

So Mr. Deputy Speaker, I am confident in Manitobans and I am confident that Manitobans, when they are given the chance, they will make the right decision. Manitobans will support the vision outlined in our Throne Speech because that came from them. It came as a result of all of my colleagues going out and listening to Manitobans.

We heard loud and clear what they wanted and that is reflected in this Throne Speech. Manitobans will support the vision outlined in our Throne Speech and they will elect a third straight consecutive Progressive Conservative government in the province of Manitoba. *[interjection]*

Keep clapping.

* (16:30)

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The hour being 4:30 p.m., I am interrupting the proceedings to put the questions necessary to dispose with the proposed motion of the honourable member for Borderland (Mr. Guenter), that is the motion for an address in reply to the Speech from the Throne and all amendments to that motion.

Therefore, the question before the House is the proposed subamendment of the honourable member for St. Boniface (Mr. Lamont), that is the subamendment to the motion for an address in reply to the Speech from the Throne.

Do members wish to have the subamendment read?

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the subamendment?

Some Honourable Members: Agreed.

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I hear a no.

Voice Vote

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those in favour of the subamendment, please say yea.

Some Honourable Members: Yea.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those opposed, please say nay.

Some Honourable Members: Nay.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: In my opinion, the Nays have it.

* * *

Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights): On division, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: On division. Defeated on division.

The question before the House is the motion of the leader of the—the honourable Leader of the Official Opposition party (Mr. Kinew), that is, the amendment to the motion for an address in reply to the Speech from the Throne.

Is it the pleasure of the House to have the amendment read?

Some Honourable Members: Agreed.

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The proposed—just want to figure out where to start reading. Okay. The amendment reads as follows:

THAT the motion be amended by adding at the end the following words:

But this House regrets that the provincial government has:

- (a) demonstrated to Manitobans that the Premier is continuing former premier Brian Pallister's agenda of health-care cuts and privatization while giving cheques to billionaires; and

- (b) refused to reverse its cuts to public healthcare and is instead pushing through further privatization of Manitoba's public health-care system, bringing the province closer to a costlier and inequitable American-style two-tier health-care system; and

- (c) fails to address the current health-care crisis in Manitoba that is putting intense strain on front-line health-care workers and patients waiting in pain in emergency rooms, especially in pediatric facilities such as the Health Science Centre's Children's Hospital; and

- (d) continued to cut northern health care and mental-health services in the North; and

- (e) fails to fill widespread staff vacancies in homecare so that seniors and vulnerable Manitobans have access to quality and timely care; and

- (f) refused to call an independent public inquiry into Manitoba's pandemic response to learn from its mistakes and bring forward changes to improve the lives of Manitoba families and strengthen the health-care system; and

- (g) continued to cut and underfund K-to-12 education in Manitoba while class sizes keep on increasing, while offering no real plans to support adult education; and

- (h) refused to address the addictions crisis by failing to provide investments into harm reduction initiatives including safe consumption sites; and

- (i) continued to make misleading statements on safe consumption sites by citing non-existent safe consumption sites in California; and

- (j) refused to address the housing crisis by failing to build affordable social and supportive housing; and

- (k) failed to act to improve access to mental-health services across the province, particularly for youth and children and those living in remote and rural areas, as well as supports for children in Child and Family Services care; and

- (l) failed to take actions to address the epidemic of missing and murdered women, girls and two-spirited people and failed to offer any concrete supports to help prevent domestic violence and to help those fleeing domestic violence; and

- (m) failed to outline how the provincial government will reduce the number of children in Child and Family Services care and support those who have left the system; and
- (n) continued to make life more expensive for average Manitobans by raising taxes on renters, cutting services, hiking hydro rates, attacking workers and increasing the price of essentials at the grocery store while offering no supports for producers; and
- (o) refused to support workers while freezing their wages and undermining workers in the public service by leaving positions vacant in important sectors such as highway safety and health care; and
- (p) continued to attack collective bargaining in the province while failing to bring in paid sick days or health and safety supports for working Manitobans to keep them safe and healthy at work; and
- (q) refused to take concrete initiatives to advance reconciliation with Indigenous peoples of Manitoba yet again by failing to complete legally required duties or make progress to repair the damage caused by former premier Pallister's hurtful comments; and
- (r) refused to increase funding for municipalities like Brandon, Dauphin, Selkirk, Gimli, Thompson and Flin Flon, leaving their budgets frozen for the seventh straight year; and
- (s) failed to take meaningful action to combat climate change, while pushing ahead with a plan to privatize provincial parks; and
- (t) failed to mention the fact the province has failed to even start the Lake Manitoba-Lake St. Martin Channels project while under-spending by millions of dollars in infrastructure projects such as highway maintenance and repair and failing to staff road clearing services adequately especially in northern Manitoba; and
- (u) continued its attack on post-secondary students and institutions by forging ahead with the plan to cut funding for universities and colleges while increasing tuition and failing to support English language services for newcomers and refugees; and
- (v) failed to offer any vision for supporting the people of northern Manitoba as the Provincial Government continues to cut essential business supports for the people of the North; and
- (w) offered no supports for producers suffering from high input costs and other challenges during this cost of living crisis; and
- (x) failed to support francophone services in Manitoba; and
- (y) failed to support an expansion of broadband services in rural and northern Manitoba; and
- (z) failed to mention how the provincial government will work towards creating an equitable Manitoba for everyone, particularly people of colour, women, Indigenous peoples and members of equity-seeking groups; and
- (aa) failed to fill vacancies in important positions in the Justice department such as Crown attorneys in locations across the province; and
- (bb) failed to implement a comprehensive plan to support people with disabilities during this cost of living crisis.

As a consequence of these and many other failings, the provincial government has thereby lost the trust and confidence of the people of Manitoba and this House.

Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the amendment?

Some Honourable Members: Yes.

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I hear a no.

Voice Vote

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those in favour of the amendment, please say yea.

Some Honourable Members: Yea.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those opposed, please say nay.

Some Honourable Members: Nay.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I believe the Nays have it.

Recorded Vote

Ms. Nahanni Fontaine (Official Opposition House Leader): A recorded vote, please.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: A recorded vote having been called, call in the members.

* (16:40)

Division

A RECORDED VOTE was taken, the result being as follows:

Yeas

Altomare, Asagwara, Brar, Bushie, Fontaine, Gerrard, Kinew, Lamont, Lamoureux, Lathlin, Lindsey, Maloway, Marcelino, Moses, Naylor, Redhead, Sala, Sandhu, Smith (Point Douglas), Wasyliw, Wiebe.

Nays

Clarke, Cox, Cullen, Eichler, Ewasko, Friesen, Goertzen, Gordon, Guenter, Guillemard, Helwer, Isleifson, Johnson, Johnston, Khan, Lagassé, Lagimodiere, Martin, Michaleski, Morley-Lecomte, Nesbitt, Pedersen, Piwniuk, Reyes, Schuler, Smith (Lagimodière), Smook, Squires, Stefanson, Teitsma, Wharton, Wishart, Wowchuk.

Clerk (Ms. Patricia Chaychuk): Yeas 21, Nays 33.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I declare the amendment lost.

* * *

Mr. Deputy Speaker: The question before the House is the motion of the honourable member for Borderland (Mr. Guenter), that is the motion for an address in reply to the Speech from the Throne.

Do members wish to have the motion read?

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion?

Some Honourable Members: Agreed.

Some Honourable Members: No.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I hear a no.

Voice Vote

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those in favour, please say yea.

Some Honourable Members: Yea.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: All those opposed, please say nay.

Some Honourable Members: Nay.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: In my opinion, the Yeas have it.

Recorded Vote

Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader): Recorded vote, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: A recorded vote having been called, call in the members.

Division

A RECORDED VOTE was taken, the result being as follows:

Yeas

Clarke, Cox, Cullen, Eichler, Ewasko, Friesen, Goertzen, Gordon, Guenter, Guillemard, Helwer, Isleifson, Johnson, Johnston, Khan, Lagassé, Lagimodiere, Martin, Michaleski, Morley-Lecomte, Nesbitt, Pedersen, Piwniuk, Reyes, Schuler, Smith (Lagimodière), Smook, Squires, Stefanson, Teitsma, Wharton, Wishart, Wowchuk.

Nays

Altomare, Asagwara, Brar, Bushie, Fontaine, Gerrard, Kinew, Lamont, Lamoureux, Lathlin, Lindsey, Maloway, Marcelino, Moses, Naylor, Redhead, Sala, Sandhu, Smith (Point Douglas), Wasyliw, Wiebe.

Clerk (Ms. Patricia Chaychuk): Yeas 33, Nays 21.

Mr. Deputy Speaker: I declare the motion carried.

* * *

Mr. Goertzen: Mr. Deputy Speaker, could you please canvass the House to see if it's the will of members to call it 5 p.m.?

Mr. Deputy Speaker: Is it the will of members to call it 5 p.m.? [*Agreed*]

The hour being 5 p.m., this House is adjourned and stands adjourned until Monday at 1:30 p.m.

Have a good and safe weekend, everybody.

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Thursday, November 24, 2022

CONTENTS

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS			
Introduction of Bills		PC Candidate for Kirkfield Park	
		Fontaine	239
		Goertzen	239
Bill 8—The Off-Road Trails Safety and Maintenance Act		Northern Health—Care Services	
Wharton	229	Redhead	240
		Gordon	240
Ministerial Statements		Federal Emergencies Act Inquiry	
Holodomor Memorial Day		Lamont	240
A. Smith	229	Goertzen	241
Wasyliw	230	Child and Family Services	
Lamoureux	230	Gerrard	241
		Squires	241
Small Business Saturday		Substance Abuse Solutions	
Cullen	231	Teitsma	242
Moses	231	Guillemard	242
Lamont	232		
Members' Statements		Water Management Strategy	
BAPS Shri Swaminarayan Mandir		Naylor	242
Schuler	232	Wharton	242
Disability Benefits		University of Manitoba—Dietetics	
Naylor	233	Moses	243
		Reyes	243
Seeking Mental Wellness		Petitions	
Lagassé	233	Executive Function Disorder Supports	
Dr. Krishan Sethi		Gerrard	245
Lindsey	234		
St. Raphael Wellness Centre		ORDERS OF THE DAY	
Gerrard	234	GOVERNMENT BUSINESS	
Oral Questions		Throne Speech	
Health—Care System		(Sixth Day of Debate)	
Kinew	234	Helwer	247
Stefanson	235	B. Smith	247
		Sandhu	251
COVID Pandemic Review		Lathlin	252
Asagwara	237	Wiebe	254
Gordon	237	Redhead	256
		Lagimodiere	257
Request to Establish Seniors Advocate		Maloway	258
Marcelino	238	Stefanson	259
Johnston	238		

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

<http://www.manitoba.ca/legislature/hansard/hansard.html>