

**Third Session - Thirty-Ninth Legislature**  
of the  
**Legislative Assembly of Manitoba**  
**Special Committee**  
on  
**Senate Reform**

*Chairperson*  
*Ms. Erna Braun*  
*Constituency of Rossmere*

**Vol. LXI No. 3 - 11:30 a.m., Monday, June 8, 2009**

**MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
**Thirty-Ninth Legislature**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Constituency</b>	<b>Political Affiliation</b>
ALLAN, Nancy, Hon.	St. Vital	N.D.P.
ALTEMEYER, Rob	Wolseley	N.D.P.
ASHTON, Steve, Hon.	Thompson	N.D.P.
BJORNSON, Peter, Hon.	Gimli	N.D.P.
BLADY, Sharon	Kirkfield Park	N.D.P.
BLAIKIE, Bill, Hon.	Elmwood	N.D.P.
BOROTSIK, Rick	Brandon West	P.C.
BRAUN, Erna	Rossmere	N.D.P.
BRICK, Marilyn	St. Norbert	N.D.P.
BRIESE, Stuart	Ste. Rose	P.C.
CALDWELL, Drew	Brandon East	N.D.P.
CHOMIAK, Dave, Hon.	Kildonan	N.D.P.
CULLEN, Cliff	Turtle Mountain	P.C.
DERKACH, Leonard	Russell	P.C.
DEWAR, Gregory	Selkirk	N.D.P.
DOER, Gary, Hon.	Concordia	N.D.P.
DRIEDGER, Myrna	Charleswood	P.C.
DYCK, Peter	Pembina	P.C.
EICHLER, Ralph	Lakeside	P.C.
FAURSCHOU, David	Portage la Prairie	P.C.
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Lib.
GOERTZEN, Kelvin	Steinbach	P.C.
GRAYDON, Cliff	Emerson	P.C.
HAWRANIK, Gerald	Lac du Bonnet	P.C.
HICKES, George, Hon.	Point Douglas	N.D.P.
HOWARD, Jennifer	Fort Rouge	N.D.P.
IRVIN-ROSS, Kerri, Hon.	Fort Garry	N.D.P.
JENNISSSEN, Gerard	Flin Flon	N.D.P.
JHA, Bidhu	Radisson	N.D.P.
KORZENIOWSKI, Bonnie	St. James	N.D.P.
LAMOUREUX, Kevin	Inkster	Lib.
LEMIEUX, Ron, Hon.	La Verendrye	N.D.P.
MACKINTOSH, Gord, Hon.	St. Johns	N.D.P.
MAGUIRE, Larry	Arthur-Virden	P.C.
MARCELINO, Flor	Wellington	N.D.P.
MARTINDALE, Doug	Burrows	N.D.P.
McFADYEN, Hugh	Fort Whyte	P.C.
McGIFFORD, Diane, Hon.	Lord Roberts	N.D.P.
MELNICK, Christine, Hon.	Riel	N.D.P.
MITCHELSON, Bonnie	River East	P.C.
NEVAKSHONOFF, Tom	Interlake	N.D.P.
OSWALD, Theresa, Hon.	Seine River	N.D.P.
PEDERSEN, Blaine	Carman	P.C.
REID, Daryl	Transcona	N.D.P.
ROBINSON, Eric, Hon.	Rupertsland	N.D.P.
RONDEAU, Jim, Hon.	Assiniboia	N.D.P.
ROWAT, Leanne	Minnedosa	P.C.
SARAN, Mohinder	The Maples	N.D.P.
SCHULER, Ron	Springfield	P.C.
SELBY, Erin	Southdale	N.D.P.
SELINGER, Greg, Hon.	St. Boniface	N.D.P.
STEFANSON, Heather	Tuxedo	P.C.
STRUTHERS, Stan, Hon.	Dauphin-Roblin	N.D.P.
SWAN, Andrew, Hon.	Minto	N.D.P.
TAILLIEU, Mavis	Morris	P.C.
WHITEHEAD, Frank	The Pas	N.D.P.
WOWCHUK, Rosann, Hon.	Swan River	N.D.P.

**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA  
SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON SENATE REFORM**

**Monday, June 8, 2009**

**TIME – 11:30 a.m.**

**LOCATION – Winnipeg, Manitoba**

**CHAIRPERSON – Ms. Erna Braun (Rossmere)**

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON – Mr. Ralph Eichler (Lakeside)**

**ATTENDANCE – 11 QUORUM – 6**

*Members of the Committee present:*

*Mses. Braun, Brick, Messrs. Dewar, Eichler, Faurschou, Ms. Howard, Mr. Lamoureux, Ms. Marcelino, Messrs. Martindale, Pedersen, Ms. Selby*

**MATTERS UNDER CONSIDERATION:**

*To consider preparations for developing the final report of the committee*

\* \* \*

**Madam Chairperson:** Good morning. Will the Special Committee on Senate Reform please come to order.

This meeting has been called to consider preparations for developing the final report of the committee. So I'm expecting that, or hoping that this will be a relatively short meeting. I've had the pleasure of having informal discussions with Mr. Eichler and Mr. Lamoureux regarding the, the framework for the report and some of the things that we feel that we can move ahead on.

And so the two agenda items that, that I see for this morning's meeting is to look at receiving the research from the researcher, as well as indicating that, as Chairperson, that I'm able to move ahead on putting the report together. So that is what I see is the agenda items today.

And, to that end, I guess, perhaps motions or—*[interjection]*—not a motion, oh, just a proposal—okay, so the proposal I have then for the committee's consideration.

**Mr. Doug Martindale (Burrows):** I think you'll probably find agreement of the entire committee that we receive the information from our researcher.

**Madam Chairperson:** And in addition to that, a sum—I think a summary of the presentations, a description of the common themes as part of that research. So is it agreed by the committee to receive the researcher's summary of presentations?

**Some Honourable Members:** Agreed.

**An Honourable Member:** Agreed, with thanks.

**Madam Chairperson:** And with, with appreciation and thanks to the researcher for doing this. So we have agreement?

**Some Honourable Members:** Agreed.

**Madam Chairperson:** Thank you very much.

So I would formally like to, on behalf of the committee, thank Greg Recksiedler for his diligence in putting this material together for the committee. So thank you very much.

The other issue that is before the committee is to have the Chair of the committee prepare the report for the committee.

**Mr. Martindale:** Yes, I think the committee would probably be in agreement that we have the Chair write the report. I guess there might be a question arise, though, about the timing and whether that can be done by Thursday of this week or not.

**Mr. Ralph Eichler (Lakeside):** Yes, I agree that the—this Chair can certainly write the report.

There was a recommendation that Eugene Szach from Civil Legal Services be made available to us. And I understand that he would make himself available in order to go over any submissions that we may want to make prior to that going to Assembly. Upon talking to him, he did make it very clear that this is a non-partisan report and that he would not

want to meet with anyone, that is, individual basis, which I agree, but he'd be more than prepared to have a look at the report, you know, with either the Chair or the Vice-Chair and the, the Liberal member as well or the committee as a whole, that, certainly, we'd have no problem with, with that side of things before we tab-table it in the House.

I do have a concern about the timing. I'm sure the Chair has been working this over the weekend and, and doing her homework. The other thing I would suggest is that in, in regards to the timing, that once the report has been drafted, if the Chair could share it with the opposition party and, of course, the Liberal Party in order to speed up the process in committee because we certainly don't want to sit here for, for hours on agreement or disagreement. So, if we could get leave of the committee for the—to instruct the Chair to do that as well.

And I have another comment, but we'll deal with this one first.

**Madam Chairperson:** So the first one then is, is there agreement among the committee that the Chairperson of the committee draft the report?

**Some Honourable Members:** Agreed.

**Madam Chairperson:** Agreed. Thank you.

And the second one is that there be discussions in sharing of the draft report with the other parties, including the Liberal member as well as the Vice-Chair?

**Some Honourable Members:** Prior to—

**Madam Chairperson:** Prior to the next meeting? Agreed?

**Some Honourable Members:** Agreed.

**Madam Chairperson:** Thank you.

**Mr. Eichler:** Madam Chair, I think just to, to, to set the record straight, if—I know at our last subcommittee hearing that we had in Norway House, there was a request put on the table that we extend the deadline for written submission. And I was wondering if the Clerk's office could, for the record, indicate whether or not we did receive that report,

and if, in fact, it was put into the committee's recommendations as far as briefings are concerned.

**Madam Chairperson:** According to our Clerk, the gentleman at Norway House who presented did not send anything further once he had received the information from us. Thank you.

**Mr. Martindale:** Yes, this morning we asked for the researcher to share the, the summary, I guess, of the presentations to the Special Committee on Senate Reform, and once that was agreed to, the research was shared immediately; it had already been done, which was good.

I'm wondering if we know whether Mr. Szach has already started writing the report or whether that only starts after our decision today.

**Mr. Eichler:** Go ahead.

**Madam Chairperson:** I haven't spoken directly with him. I've made inquiries, and my understanding is that it could be very short notice for him to be able to do that. But I can certainly look into it again and see if anything has changed since last week.

**Mr. Martindale:** Well, I'm wondering, then, what the process is if it isn't ready by Thursday. Then, presumably, the House leaders need to ask for an extension, and then we won't be sitting anymore and—but, presumably, we would have a date that—or we'd still set a target date. What would the process be?

**Madam Chairperson:** It is the House that would make that decision. It would have to be brought to the House and that, that decision would be made at that time as, as has been indicated to me that that's a responsibility that falls in that jurisdiction.

**Mr. David Faurshou (Portage la Prairie):** Further to the presentation to the House of this committee's report, is there any direction thereafter where the report will be publicized or how it will be handled in the, in the Chamber? At this juncture in time, will we be able to publicly release our report so that there may be further commentary by the public after, after seeing this committee's report?

\* (11:40)

**Madam Chairperson:** According to the governing act, the committee must make a report to the Speaker of the Assembly. The Speaker must table a copy of the report in the Assembly. If the Assembly is not sitting when the Speaker receives the report, the Speaker must direct that copies be sent to members of the Assembly and then make the report available to the public.

If the Assembly by resolution approves the recommendations of the committee or approves them with alterations, the Speaker must send the Assembly resolution to the Queen's Privy Council for Canada.

So that, that would be the process as it's set out in legislation.

Are there any other further comments or questions?

The hour being 11:41, what is the will of the committee?

**An Honourable Member:** Committee rise.

**Madam Chairperson:** Committee rise.

**COMMITTEE ROSE AT: 11:41 a.m.**

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings  
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

**<http://www.gov.mb.ca/legislature/hansard/index.html>**