

1



## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

### VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 24

FIFTH SESSION, THIRTY-SIXTH LEGISLATURE

#### PRAYERS

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

Hon. Mr. CUMMINGS, the Minister of Natural Resources made a statement concerning the flood situation in the Souris River watershed.

Mr. STRUTHERS commented on the statement.

By leave, Hon. Mr. DERKACH introduced Bill (No. 24) – The Municipal Amendment Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur les municipalités, which was read a First Time.

(Recommended by His Honour, the Lieutenant Governor)

Hon. Mr. DERKACH presented:

Message from His Honour, the Lieutenant Governor recommending the disposition of public revenue for Bill (No. 24)

(Sessional Paper No. 103)

Following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following rulings:

I am ruling on a point of order raised by the Official Opposition House Leader on April 16, 1999 respecting words used by the Honourable First Minister with respect to the Honourable Member for Crescentwood. The Premier said, quoting from the Monnin Report, "Sale, by his own admission told Sorokowski 'it is my understanding that if you don't want to meet with the investigators you don't have to'" but also said "He was behind the scenes counselling people to break the law and not appear before the inquiry".

As I have previously ruled, it is not in order to use unparliamentary language or make a charge against another Member by the device of putting the words into the mouth of someone else.

Therefore I am ruling that the House Leader of the Official Opposition did have a point of order and I am calling on the Honourable First Minister to withdraw the words he spoke on April 16 which imputed unworthy motives to the Honourable Member for Crescentwood.

**Monday, May 10, 1999**

---

WHEREUPON the Honourable First Minister withdrew his comments.

---

On April 21 I took under advisement a point of order raised by the Honourable Member for The Maples. His point of order concerned words spoken by the Honourable Member for Thompson respecting the Honourable Member for Inkster.

I would note that Speaker Rocan made a number of rulings respecting alleged impugned motives. In particular, on May 30, 1989 he stated:

*“this is a forum in which strong and often opposing views are held and it is a forum in which unkind, but not necessarily unparliamentary words and phrases unfortunately will be used from time to time”*

I have read the Hansard record and am ruling that this was a dispute over the facts. There was not, in my opinion, an imputation of unworthy motives nor a personal charge made.

---

Pursuant to Rule 20 (1), Mrs. DRIEDGER (Charleswood), Messrs. EVANS (Interlake), PENNER, CHOMIAK and LAMOUREUX made Members' Statements.

---

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. GILLESHAMMER:

THAT this House approve in general the budgetary policy of the government.

And the Proposed Motion of Mr. LAMOUREUX moved in amendment thereto:

THAT the motion be amended by adding thereto the following words:

BUT that this House regrets;

THAT this government, by neglecting to incorporate in their budgets the full financial activity of crown corporations and their complete pension liabilities, by failing to report the cost of the purchase of Centra Gas, by draining the fiscal stabilization fund for partisan political reasons, and by failing to respond to the demand for clearer accounting practices, as recommended by the provincial auditor, has tabled a budget that does not reflect the transparency, openness and accountability that Manitobans expect from their provincial government and has turned the provincial budget into an election platform and therefore this House has lost confidence in the government and has thereby lost the confidence of this legislature and the people of Manitoba.

**Monday, May 10, 1999**

---

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Mr. REID speaking,

During debate, Mr. LAMOUREUX rose on a point of order requesting a quorum count.

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House that there were enough members to constitute a quorum.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Mr. REID speaking,

During debate, Mr. KOWALSKI rose on a point of order regarding comments allegedly spoken by the Honourable Member for Transcona in reference to the Honourable Member for Inkster.

And Mr. REID having spoken to the point order,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House she would take the matter under advisement.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Mr. REID concluding his remarks,

And Hon. Mr. RADCLIFFE having spoken,

And Mr. CHOMIAK speaking,

During debate, Mr. LAMOUREUX rose on a point of order requesting a quorum count.

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House that there were enough members to constitute a quorum.

And the debate continuing on the amendment,

And Mr. CHOMIAK concluding his remarks,

And Hon. Mr. TWEED, Mr. ASHTON, Hon. Mr. FILMON having spoken,

And the Question being put on the amendment,

It was negatived, on the following division:

**YEA**

LAMOUREUX..... 1

**NAY**

ASHTON  
BARRETT  
CERILLI  
CHOMIAK  
CUMMINGS  
DERKACH  
DEWAR  
DOER  
DOWNEY  
DRIEDGER (Charleswood)  
DRIEDGER (Steinbach)  
DYCK  
ENNS  
EVANS (Brandon East)  
EVANS (Interlake)  
FAURSCHOU  
FILMON  
FINDLAY  
FRIESEN  
GILLESHAMMER  
HELWER  
HICKES  
JENNISSEN  
LAURENDEAU  
MACKINTOSH (St. Johns)

MALOWAY  
MARTINDALE  
McALPINE  
McGIFFORD  
McINTOSH (Assiniboia)  
MIHYCHUK  
MITCHELSON  
NEWMAN  
PENNER  
PITURA  
PRAZNIK  
RADCLIFFE  
REID  
REIMER  
RENDER  
ROCAN  
SALE  
SANTOS  
STEFANSON  
STRUTHERS  
SVEINSON  
TOEWS  
TWEED  
VODREY  
WOWCHUK ..... 50

And the Question being put on the main motion,

It was agreed to, on the following division:

**YEA**

ASHTON  
BARRETT  
CERILLI  
CHOMIAK  
CUMMINGS  
DERKACH  
DEWAR  
DOER  
DOWNEY  
DRIEDGER (Charleswood)  
DRIEDGER (Steinbach)  
DYCK  
ENNS  
EVANS (Brandon East)  
EVANS (Interlake)  
FAURSCHOU  
FILMON  
FINDLAY  
FRIESEN  
GILLESHAMMER  
HELWER  
HICKES  
JENNISSEN  
LAURENDEAU  
LATHLIN  
MACKINTOSH (St. Johns)

MALOWAY  
MARTINDALE  
McALPINE  
McGIFFORD  
McINTOSH (Assiniboia)  
MIHYCHUK  
MITCHELSON  
NEWMAN  
PENNER  
PITURA  
PRAZNIK  
RADCLIFFE  
REID  
REIMER  
RENDER  
ROCAN  
SALE  
SANTOS  
STEFANSON  
STRUTHERS  
SVEINSON  
TOEWS  
TWEED  
VODREY  
WOWCHUK ..... 51

**NAY**

LAMOUREUX ..... 1

---

The House then adjourned at 5:42 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. tomorrow.

Hon. Louise Dacquay,  
Speaker.