

Thursday, June 18, 1998



## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

### VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 67

FOURTH SESSION, THIRTY-SIXTH LEGISLATURE

#### PRAYERS

10:00 O'CLOCK A.M.

On motion of Mr. HELWER:

ORDERED that the composition of the Standing Committees be amended as follows:

#### Law Amendments

Friday, June 19, 1998 at 9:30 a.m.:

Hon. Mr. PRAZNIK for Hon. Mr. GILLESHAMMER,  
Mrs. RENDER for Hon. Mr. DERKACH,  
Mr. TWEED for Mr. DYCK,  
Hon. Mr. PITURA for Hon. Mr. TOEWS.

#### Economic Development

Friday, June 19, 1998 at 9:30 a.m.:

Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH for Hon. Mr. DOWNEY,  
Mr. FAURSCHOU for Mr. ROCAN,  
Mr. LAURENDEAU for Mr. PENNER,  
Hon. Mrs. VODREY for Mr. TWEED.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. STEFANSON:

THAT Bill (No. 11) - The Treasury Branches Repeal Act; Loi abrogeant la Loi sur les caisses d'épargne, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Ms. BARRETT,

And Messrs. SALE, JENNISSON, HICKES, EVANS (Brandon East), Ms. FRIESEN and Messrs. MARTINDALE and KOWALSKI having spoken,

**Thursday, June 18, 1998**

---

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to, on division.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH:

THAT Bill (No. 26) - The Teachers' Society Amendment Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'Association des enseignants du Manitoba, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Mr. MARTINDALE,

And Ms. FRIESEN speaking at 12:00 p.m.,

The debate was allowed to remain in her name.

---

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

The following petitions were presented:

Mr. LAMOUREUX - Minister of Justice to consider establishing an Independent Judicial Review Committee to report to the Legislature on ways in which our judicial system may better service the public of Manitoba (P. R. Carasig, D. Carasig, M. Cordova and others)

Mr. SANTOS - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (H. Thibrt, G. Kourdi, G. Sinclair and others)

Mr. HICKES - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (A. Courchene, M. Bagnulo, A. Courchene and others)

Mr. MARTINDALE - Minister of Health to consider immediately cancelling the hospital food proposal and concentrate on delivering quality health care instead of using health dollars to provide contracts for private firms (N. Jsurre, M. Wirth, A. Silva and others)

Mr. MALOWAY - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (D. Miner, B. LeBlanc, A. Antonio and others)

---

**Thursday, June 18, 1998**

---

By leave, the House reverted to "Ministerial Statements and Tabling of Reports" and Hon. Mr. RADCLIFFE presented:

Annual Report of The Public Utilities Board for the calendar year ended December 31, 1997.

(Sessional Paper No. 209)

---

Following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following rulings:

I am ruling on a matter taken under advisement on May 14 during Question Period. The point of order arose from an answer given by the Honourable First Minister to a question asked by the Honourable Leader of the Official Opposition.

The point of order raised by the House Leader for the Official Opposition was that the answer did not answer the question and that words spoken by the Premier should be withdrawn.

Hansard shows that the First Minister said, "*. . . we have a member opposite who clearly broke the law by revealing names of people who were on the list of the--and he does nothing about it. He is proud of it. He thinks that is a good thing, a good example to set for Manitobans.*"

What the First Minister said was out of order, according to Beauchesne citation 481(f); it amounts to a personal charge and I am asking him to withdraw the comments.

Hon. Mr. FILMON withdrew his remarks.

Following Madam Speaker's ruling, Mr. ASHTON rose on a point of order and stated that the withdrawal of words requested by the Speaker in her ruling were to be unequivocal, and further stated that the comments made by the Honourable First Minister when making his withdrawal, in accordance with the ruling, should be withdrawn,

And Hon. Mr. McCRAE having spoken to the point of order,

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker informed the House she would take the matter under advisement.

---

The Deputy Opposition House Leader rose on a point of order on May 21 respecting the fact that the Honourable Member for Emerson had entered the Chamber while the question was being put on a motion, and after the division bells had been turned off. I thank all Honourable Members who gave advice to me on the matter.

**Thursday, June 18, 1998**

---

The issue arose in the Committee of Supply and Speakers both in Manitoba and in the Canadian House of Commons have many times ruled that committee matters should be resolved in that forum, and not in the House. As Beauchesne citation 760(3) states, committees are and must remain masters of their own procedure. Therefore I am unable to rule on the matter.

However, I understand that the Honourable Member for Emerson subsequently in Committee of Supply apologized for his actions and acknowledged that he should not have entered the Chamber for a vote in Committee of Supply once the bells were turned off.

---

Pursuant to Rule 20(1), Ms. BARRETT, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Messrs. ASHTON, LAURENDEAU and LAMOUREUX made Members' Statements.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH:

THAT Bill (No. 26) - The Teachers' Society Amendment Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'Association des enseignants du Manitoba, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Ms. FRIESEN concluding her remarks,

And Mr. LAMOUREUX having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH:

THAT Bill (No. 34) - The Public Schools Amendment Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur les écoles publiques, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Mr. JENNISSEN,

And Ms. FRIESEN and Mr. LAMOUREUX having spoken,

**Thursday, June 18, 1998**

---

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. TOEWS:

THAT Bill (No. 43) - The Victims' Rights and Consequential Amendments Act; Loi sur les droits des victimes et modifications corrélatives, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Mr. ASHTON,

And Messrs. MACKINTOSH and LAMOUREUX having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH:

THAT Bill (No. 53) - The Apprenticeship and Trades Qualifications Act; Loi sur l'apprentissage et la qualification professionnelle, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have the matter remain in the name of Ms. BARRETT,

And Messrs. REID and LAMOUREUX and Ms. FRIESEN having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

**Thursday, June 18, 1998**

---

By leave, it was agreed to waive Private Members' Business for today, June 18, 1998, only.

\_\_\_\_\_

By leave, it was agreed that the Standing Committee on Law Amendments would meet Monday, June 22, 1998 at 3:00 p.m. (if necessary), concurrently with the House.

\_\_\_\_\_

On motion of Mr. HELWER:

ORDERED that the composition of the Standing Committee on Law Amendments be amended as follows:

Monday, June 22, 1998:  
Hon. Mrs. McINTOSH for Hon. Mr. PRAZNIK,  
Mr. HELWER for Mr. TWEED,  
Mr. SVEINSON for Hon. Mr. PITURA.

\_\_\_\_\_

Madam Speaker having left the Chair and the House resolving itself into a Committee to consider of the Supply to be granted to Her Majesty;

And the House continuing in Committee.

\_\_\_\_\_

On motion of Ms. BARRETT:

ORDERED that the composition of the Standing Committee on Law Amendments be amended as follows:

Monday, June 22, 1998 at 10:00 a.m.:  
Mr. REID for Mr. CHOMIAK,  
Ms. FRIESEN for Mr. MALOWAY,  
Ms. MIHYCHUK for Ms. McGIFFORD,  
Mr. MACKINTOSH for Mr. SALE.

\_\_\_\_\_

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Monday next.

Hon. Louise Dacquay,  
Speaker.